

Policy Report

Data on Post-9/11 Terrorism in the United States

Last Updated: June 2012

Executive Summary¹

A Brief Note on Methodology

This policy report examines the challenges posed by violent extremists to our national security. It is comprised of two parts.

The first section does a statistical examination of convictions in terrorism trials since 9/11. This part primarily draws on data and analysis from New York University's Center for Law and Security and Syracuse University's Transactional Records Access Clearinghouse.

The second section of the report is focused on MPAC's Post-9/11 Terrorism Incident Database and an analysis of its information. The Database contains two open-source datasets for comparative analysis: one focused on Muslim violent extremists; other focused on non-Muslim violent extremists. A third, subset of post-Obama election plots by Muslim violent extremists is also added to measure possible trends of ideological extremism in Muslim American communities.

All entries into the Database are incidents believed to be directly threatening United States.

Additionally, the Database has three other key features:

1. Our data draws upon work done by other organizations. The Muslim dataset primarily draws upon tracking done by the Congressional Research Service and the Heritage Foundation. The non-Muslim dataset draws primarily from the Southern Poverty Law Center, Anti-Defamation League, and DT Analytics -- a private security firm specializing in domestic terrorism and extremism.

Both datasets are supplemented by MPAC's additional research, based on information from 1) official government documents such as affidavits, criminal complaints, and press releases, and 2) local, national and international mainstream media reporting.

- 2. Only violent plots against people are counted in the "Ecodataset. Therefore, terrorists" tend to be excluded, because: 1) their violence overwhelmingly directed property, rather than people and 2) to ensure numbers are not inflated from those incidents of violence against property instead of people. They are only included when it can be reasonably assessed violence is directed at people.
- 3. The report is deliberately more inclusive of Muslim violent extremists. The Muslim dataset accounts for both U.S. and foreign-originated plots. The non-Muslim dataset is restricted only to U.S.-originated plots.

Summary of the Findings

- Since 9/11, only 47% of socalled "jihadist" suspects publicly associated with terrorism were prosecuted under a terrorism or national security statute.
- There were 135 total plots by U.S.-originated non-Muslim perpetrators against the United States since 9/11. In comparison,

there have been 60 total plots by *U.S. and foreign-originated* Muslim perpetrators since 9/11.

- There have been least 10 incidents of non-Muslim violent extremists possessing or attempting possess to Biological, Chemical or Radiological weapons. One of those incidents occurred since Obama's election. No such cases involving Muslim violent extremists have been reported since 9/11.
- Evidence clearly indicates a general rise in violent extremism across ideologies. Using Obama's election as our measurement, since November 4, 2008 there have been 88 plots by non-Muslim violent domestic extremists. By comparison, there have been 36 plots by Muslim U.S. foreign-originated extremists. and Each of these categories constitutes more than 50% of all violent extremist cases in each dataset since 9/11.
- Yet, there is little evidence of rising *ideological* extremism among Muslim Americans. We use Obama's election as the start of a timeline for measurement. We found 19 out of 31 post-election plots (61%) involved Muslim Americans engaging in ideological extremism before the vote. 10 out of 31 cases (32%) are individuals involved in extremist activities

after Obama's election. 2 cases (6%) remain unknown.

Al-Qaeda does not appear to be making new *ideological* gains into the Muslim American community. Instead, the data is pointing toward greater numbers of longstanding ideological extremists turning to violence. Additional research by Syracuse and Duke Universities indicated a decline in violent extremism among Muslim Americans.

Muslim communities helped U.S. security officials to prevent nearly 2 out of every 5 Al-Qaeda plots threatening the United States since 9/11. It highlights the importance of partnering with society through good relations and community oriented policing.

This report offers the following policy recommendations:

- Expand community-oriented policing initiatives
- Increase support for research on combating biased policing
- Expand investments in better human capital acquisitions
- Highlight citizen contributions to national security
- Reform the fusion center process to increase coordination among law enforcement
- Adopt MPAC's "four essential principles" to successful engagement with Muslim American communities

Introduction

The arrests of individuals spanning from New York City, Baltimore, and Washington, D.C., to Detroit, Fort Hood and Baltimore have prompted concerns over whether there is a rise in domestic violent extremism against the United States. Yet the discussion of these incidents tends to lack proper context and solid empirical basis.

Additionally, a narrow focus on Muslim violent extremism is shortsighted. Terrorism is a phenomenon occurring among extremists of many ideological orientations – Muslim and non-Muslim* alike.

This report quantitatively examines the challenges posed by Muslim violent extremists in two ways. The first is by examining the quantitative and qualitative nature of terrorism trials. Second, it looks at the number of actual and attempted attacks within the United States. It also employs a comparative analysis with domestic non-Muslim incidents.

This report will be regularly updated.

reasonably assessed violence is directed at people.

Terrorism Trials

If the threat of terrorism is extremely significant, it would be reasonable to expect many charges would be applied to law enforcement investigations billed as terrorism-related. However the hard data contradicts certain popular notions.

A 2009 study by the *Transactional Records* Access Clearinghouse (TRAC) at Syracuse University found within the last five years, Federal attorneys declined to bring any charges against 67% of alleged terrorism-related cases referred to them from law enforcement agencies. In 2008, this statistic rose to a 73% decline rate of referred cases from law enforcement organizations.²

When examining those remaining terrorism-related cases going to trial, publicly available data also paints a sobering picture. According to a study by the Center for Law and Security (CLS), examining "iihadist" terrorism trials from September 11, 2001 to September 11, 2011, 204 out of 431 (47.3%) cases that were successfully prosecuted involved a terrorism or national security violation.4 That less than half of all prosecuted "jihadist" trials involve a national security and/or terrorism charge has led one commentator at the American Criminal Law Review to note, "This suggests that the numbers of jihadist terror cases, and the perceived public threat of iihadist terrorism, is exaggerated in some part by relatively minor cases."5

In fairness, law enforcement officials may argue terrorist plots sometimes need to be preempted, even before the necessary evidence is gathered to backup national security and/or terrorism charges. However when examining this claim, an earlier CLS report further noted:⁶

^{*} Our non-Muslim extremist category consists mostly of violent Right-Wing extremists: specifically White Nationalists, anti-government "militias", and Christian extremists. However it also includes two cases from Black Separatists (Nation of Islam), two Jewish extremist cases, two Anarchist cases and one heterodox cult. "Ecoterrorists" tend to be excluded, deliberately, because: 1) their violence is overwhelmingly directed at property, rather than people and 2) to ensure numbers are not inflated from those incidents of violence against property instead of people. They are only included when it can be

...the DoJ [Department of Justice] may have acted in order to disrupt potential threats to public safety, although it is apparent that these allegations and any evidence supporting them are insufficient to determine whether or not an actual plot was disrupted.

As the data shows, there are a fairly limited number of cases involving dangerous violent indicators, such as the possession of explosives. Yet, even in these limited cases, significant questions surrounding these incidents exist. CLS Executive Director, Karen Greenberg, has previously noted:⁷

...in some cases—such as Fort Dix—allegations of conspiracy to use [Weapons of Mass Destruction]**
WMDs have been plagued with assertions that the defendants had neither the know-how nor the sophistication to actually carry out their intentions. They were, rather, deemed bumblers and wannabees.

Finally, the September 2011 CLS report's data found the average sentence for those convicted of terrorism and national security charges were each slightly over 15 years. However given that the majority of cases (52.7%) did not involve either of these serious charges, the average overall sentence rate is between 5 to 6 years. In fact those facing neither of these two core charges received an average sentence slightly more than 1 year.

While there is no doubt that Muslim violent extremists pose a serious challenge to American security, an examination of terror trial data shows there has been significant mislabeling of trials and misapplication of counterterrorism resources.

This has serious implications for US policymakers as they seek to engage public concerns over national security and make tough choices when allocating limited resources.

Over-labeling trials as terrorism-related when the majority of them are prosecuted on other charges unnecessarily heightens public fear, rather than building levelheaded vigilance.

Furthermore, the counterterrorism assets used to investigate and prosecute individuals committing non-terrorism or national security violations is a severe misapplication of our nation's limited resources that must be directed at actual terrorist threats.

Comparative Incident Analysis

Looking at terrorism trials is only one aspect of seeking to identify threat trends. The second method is by tracking terrorist incidents – prevented and occurred – within and against the United States since 9/11. It also includes a comparative analysis with non-Muslim extremist incidents.

According to MPAC's Post-9/11 Terrorism Database,*** there have been at least 60 planned terrorist attacks against

^{**} Not to be confused with Chemical, Biological, Radiological and Nuclear (CBRN) devices. Federal statutes on "Weapons of Mass Destruction" also include various non-CBRN explosive devices.

^{***} MPAC's Post-9/11 Database is completely open source. Sources include mainstream media, government documents, and tracking from organizations including the *Congressional Research Service, Heritage Foundation* and the *Southern Poverty Law Center.* Refer to the appendices at the end for more information on the sources and explanation of the Database's categories and definitions.

the United States, which have been attributed to Muslims.¹¹ This category includes both domestic and international-based incidents/plots against the United States. There have been 17 deaths from post-9/11 Muslim violent extremists.

However, the number of incidents/plots should also be viewed with caution. MPAC's Database also recorded 14 out of 60 (23.3%) of alleged violent extremist incidents/plots that involved Muslims reaching only the "aspirational stage." In other words over 1 out every 5 plots involving Muslim violent extremists arrested for terrorism or national security did not involve possession or attempted possession of weapons.

None of 60 alleged incidents/plots possession attempted involved or possession of chemical, biological, radiological, or nuclear (CBRN) bombs. 55 of these incidents/plots were not implemented while 5 attacks actually took place, 8.3% Muslim violent extremist implementation rate.

However a singular focus on Muslim violent extremists is shortsighted. Terrorism has historically been practiced by extremists of various ideological orientations.¹² In order to allow for better context of incidents from Muslim extremists, we also provide a comparative analysis of incidents from non-Muslim extremists.

Non-Muslim violent extremists are also included because of the concern they elicit from state-level law enforcement. A 2007 survey by the *University of Maryland's Study of Terrorism and Responses to Terrorism* (START) center, found Muslim violent extremists were seen as the greatest threat to national security by state law enforcement agencies.

However the START survey found non-Muslim violent extremists came in a close second place. ¹³ Furthermore, the survey also found, "...just as many state-police agencies (62%) view Neo-Nazis as posing a serious threat to their own state's security as consider Islamic Jihadists to pose a serious threat." ¹⁴

Interestingly, the same START study also found law enforcement identified domestic extremist groups operating within their states more often than Muslim extremists. (*See the inset below*). ¹⁵

- Neo-Nazi (92% of responding states)
- Militia/Patriot (89%)
- Racist Skinheads (89%)
- Freemen/ Sovereign Citizen (87%)
- Extreme animal rights (76%)
- Extreme environmentalists (73%)
- KKK (73%)
- Christian Identity (70%)
- Extreme anti-tax (67%)

- Extreme anti-immigrant (65%)
- Islamic Jihadi groups (62%)
- Extreme anti-abortion groups (62%)
- Extreme Black nationalists (54%)
- Odinists (35%)
- Left-wing revolutionary groups (32%)
- Idiosyncratic sectarians (32%)
- Other extremist groups (11%)
- Doomsday cults (8%)

While, MPAC's Database recorded at least 60 incidents/plots by Muslim violent extremists, it also recorded 133

incidents/plots by non-Muslim violent extremists (135 if Nation of Islam cases are included). 129 out of 135 non-

Muslim incidents/plots reached the "operational stage." There have been 56 deaths from post-9/11 non-Muslim terrorists, 68 if the "DC Sniper" shootings are included.

Furthermore, the Database recorded 10 plots by non-Muslim extremists involving the use of CBRN weaponry. They include at least 5 attempts to acquire materials for developing a CBRN weapon and 5 cases involving actual possession of materials for a CBRN weapon.

Out of the 133 (or 135) alleged incidents/plots, 50 were implemented, while the other 84 were foiled, an overall 37% non-Muslim violent extremist implementation rate. In other words, nearly 2 out of every 5 non-Muslim terrorism attempt have been implemented.

A Rise in Ideological Extremism Among Muslim Americans?

With the spike of recent arrests of alleged violent extremists in the United States, some analysts are concerned these arrests may also indicate a rise in ideological extremism**** among Muslim Americans. ¹⁷ While there have been a number of highprofile arrests recently within a short time span, others point out that, "...the issue of homegrown terrorism plots is a serious

**** This is also sometimes referred to as "radicalization." Radicalization differs from violent extremism in that former is the intellectual approval of violence against civilians, whereas the latter also includes actual violence, incitement, or material support in support of one's extremist position. For full definitions, see: Alejandro J. Beutel, *Building Bridges to Strengthen America: Forging an Effective Counterterrorism Enterprise between Muslim Americans and Law Enforcement.* (Washington, D.C.: Muslim Public Affairs Council, August 2010), P. 12.

one, but would [also] caution that it is not a pandemic..."¹⁸

In order to measure any recent trends, a timeline needs to be established. This report uses November 4, 2008, Obama's election victory, as beginning of a timeline for measurement. It does so for two reasons:

- 1) Transnational terrorists, like Al-Qaeda and its affiliates, may see the presence of a new administration as an opportunity to force a policy overreaction after an attack, or have the President risk losing public legitimacy.¹⁹ Also, online discussions from Al-Qaeda sympathizers indicate they are threatened by Obama's potential charisma.²⁰
- 2) Domestic terrorists, particularly rightwing violent extremists, are upset over the election of a non-White President, national demographic changes, and/or current concerns over the economy.²¹

Referring again to MPAC's Database, since Obama's Presidential election, there have been 36 attempted terrorist attacks by Muslim extremists, or 60% of all incidents/plots by Muslim terrorists against the United States since 9/11. Out of these post-Obama incidents, 34 were prevented. This represents a 5.6% Muslim violent extremist implementation rate in the post-Obama election period.

For non-Muslim extremists, there have been 88 attempted terrorist attacks since Obama was elected. This represents 65% of all terrorist attacks committed by non-Muslim terrorists since 9/11. Out of these 88 attempted incidents, 54 were prevented, representing a 39% non-Muslim incident implementation rate in

the post-Obama election victory period. In other words, in a post-Obama period, nearly 2 of out every 5 non-Muslim violent extremists plots have been implemented.

While it is clear that there has been a rise in *violent* extremism since Obama's election – among Muslims and non-Muslims alike – these figures do not tell us whether or not a trend toward *ideological* extremism (potentially leading to violence) exists. In order to measure whether or not there has been a recent rise in ideological extremism among Muslim Americans, we examine the data Muslim violent extremists further.

Again, we use Obama's election as a baseline to determine what is to be "recent." Among the considered extremist plots, 31 Muslim violent involved Muslim Americans. instance, Umar Farouk Abdulmutallab is a U.S. citizen, a permanent resident, or long-term resident*****.) If there were a recent rise in ideological extremism one would expect a majority or a significant minority of violent extremists to have been radicalized after the election.

Using court documents and mainstream media report as our sources, we found the people involved in 19 out of the 31 post-Obama election plots (61%) were engaged in ideological extremism before the Presidential vote. 2 cases (6%) remain unknown. 10 out of 31 cases (32%), are individuals known to have been involved in extremist activities since Obama's election. (For the complete subset displaying the results and their interpretation, see Appendix C, after the endnotes.)

Our findings do not support the notion of a recent rise in ideological extremism. In fact, the overwhelming number individuals involved in "recent" plots had engaged in ideological extremism several years. Al-Qaeda and its sympathizers have found it very difficult to make any ideological inroads among American Muslims over the years and these results continue to support that notion. American Muslims have been, and continue to be, overwhelmingly mainstream and antiextremist.

Rather than a seeing a rise in ideological extremism, the data points toward greater numbers of *preexisting ideological extremists turning to violence*. While this phenomenon poses its own separate security challenges, a potential silver lining exists.

Other data-driven studies point toward declining trends in ideological extremism among American Muslims. For instance, a June 2010 report from Syracuse's TRAC center found federal prosecutions between June 2009 and June 2010 are down 53% from 2005.22 A February 2011 study from Duke University's Triangle Center on Terrorism and Homeland Security found that the number of Muslim Americans apprehended for terrorism dropped by 57%, from 47 in 2009 to 20 in 2010.²³ The study went on to note, "the total for 2010 suggests that the previous year may have been more of an aberration than a trend."24

Overtime, the spike in domestic violent extremist activity may fizzle out because there will be few individuals left willing to engage in violence and even fewer who are capable of doing so. Rather than being able to expand its network of supporters, extremists face an increasingly difficult operational and recruiting environment.

^{******} Defined as someone living within the sovereign territory of the United States for 5 continuous years or more.

The likelihood of this forecast increases in light of the recent death of Anwar Al-Awlaki and Inspire magazine editor, Samir Khan. According to an analysis of the last 28 plots since Barack Obama was elected, Al-Awlaki played an inspirational and/or operational role in 18 of the 36 plots. (See Appendix D for more information.) While some analysts are skeptical that Al-Awlaki and Khan's deaths will not significantly affect Al-Qaeda in the Arabian Peninsula's (AQAP) overall operational capabilities it seems it will mitigate the "homegrown" threat to the American homeland by severely reducing the capability of AQAP, and Al-Qaeda at-large to attract potential English-speaking American recruits to its cause.25

Others, however, caution that Al-Awlaki's writings have an "enduring appeal" and that his recent death will garner further sympathy for his ideology and violent justifications among fellow sympathizers. ²⁷

Those "homegrown" extremists daring to engage in violence are not regarded as well-trained and ideologically hardened as the 9/11 hijackers. Instead, many analysts view them as "wannabees," "nitwits," and "idiots." Not surprising this has lead to, "U.S.-based jihadis hav [ing] a nearly unbroken record of operational failure." Rather than signaling increasing influence, the rise in Al-Qaeda-inspired violent extremism within the United States signals the ideological movement's increasing weakness.

Terrorists in the United States and CBRN Weaponry: A Quick Summary

Our Database shows ten cases of attempted or actual possession of CBRN material. These ten incidents are:

- 1. **September-October 2001:** Presumed bioterrorism suspect Dr. Bruce Ivins is believed to have mailed several letters laced with Anthrax to various media and U.S. Senate offices across the country, killing 5 people and sickening another 17.
- 2. **March 12, 2002**: Anarchist Joseph Konopka was found in possession of deadly amounts of sodium cyanide and potassium cyanide.³²
- 3. **April 10, 2003**: Anti-government extremist William Krar is arrested and found in possession of a massive of catch of small arms and a cyanide bomb capable of killing up to 6,000 people.³³
- 4. **October 25, 2004**: Neo-Nazi Demetrius "Van" Crocker is arrested for attempting to acquire Sarin nerve agent and C-4 plastic explosives.³⁴
- 5. **October 3, 2006**: Survivalist Denys Ray Hughes was arrested in 2006 and sentenced in October 2006 to seven years in prison for the illegal manufacture of ricin and illegal possession of firearms.³⁵
- 6. **January 29, 2008**: Anti-government extremist Michael Alan Crooker was federally indicted on possessing ricin and abrin toxins. He has previously been indicted in 2004 for also threatening to use a weapon of mass destruction against a federal building in Springfield, Massachusetts.³⁶
- 7. **December 9, 2008**: The FBI discovers "radiological dispersal device components and literature, and radioactive materials" at the home of Neo-Nazi James Cummings. He was failed to fully develop the device because his wife, due to domestic abuse, murdered him.³⁷

- 8. **October 20, 2011**: Four anti-government extremists are arrested and charged for plotting to acquire and use guns, explosives, and the biological toxin ricin against U.S. federal officials and institutions. The suspects had acquired requisite castor beans to make ricin, but had not changed them into a toxic form.³⁸
- 9. **April 25, 2012**: Martin Kimber is arrested chemical weapons charges for repeatedly poisoning the food at an Albany, NY-area hospital with mercury. A search of his home turned more two jars filled with mercury, as well as Nazi paraphernalia and a copy of the *Turner Diaries*, a white supremacist violent fiction book that also inspired Oklahoma City bomber Timothy McVeigh.³⁹
- 10. **May 8, 2012**: Over a dozen Neo-Nazis in rural were stockpiling firearms and explosives, as well as receiving combat training from a fellow Neo-Nazi in the Missouri State National Guard in order to prepare to instigate a national "race war". Members of the group had also reportedly sought to acquire ricin.

Community Oriented Policing Counterterrorism: A New Way Forward

Data presented in this report shows terrorism is a more complex phenomenon than some may expect. Furthermore, the use of terrorism is not limited to Muslims; data shows significant activity from non-Muslim extremists too.

A singular focus on Muslim terrorists is both bad for national security and civil society. Even if one were to focus only on Muslim communities, the arrests of individuals such as the "North Carolina 7," the "Fort Dix Six", Abdulhakim Mujahid and Colleen "Jihad Jane" LaRose provide a few examples of individuals who do not fit a specific terrorist profile.⁴⁰ In fact numerous studies and experts have stated there is no reliable "terrorist profile."

It not only potentially leads to biased law enforcement, but also runs the risk of misallocating limited resources. Particular communities may get over-scrutinized while real threats – by actors from a variety of ideologies – go undetected. All communities, irrespective of race, ethnicity, and faith, must exercise vigilance.

Additionally the data appears to indicate that more surveillance powers do not necessarily make America safer. incidents, Numerous terrorist across ideologies, continue occurring after legislation reducing civil liberties protections – like the PATRIOT Act renewals and 2008 FISA Amendmentswere passed. Instead, more information gathering is needed.

In order to effectively move forward to address terrorist all threats America, we propose integrating greater elements of community-oriented policing local, state and federal counterterrorism strategies. Communityoriented policing is a law enforcement "...collaborative strategy emphasizing, partnerships between the law enforcement agency and the individuals and organizations they serve to develop solutions to problems and increase trust in police."42

Working with local communities based on relationships of trust has been extremely effective at fighting various types of crime, 43 including terrorism. 44

One of the most important benefits of trusted partnerships is the ability for community members to feel comfortable enough to step forward and provide critical information to prevent any crime, including terrorism.

A Short List of Terror Plots Disrupted by Muslim Community Assistance

- 1. **September 2002**: Members of the "Lackawanna 6" are arrested. FBI first becomes aware of their activities in June 2001 when a local Muslim community member tips off the FBI.⁴⁵
- 2. **June 2003**: FBI receives two tips from community members notifying them "military-style training" being conducted suspect by Ali Al-Tamimi. The tips start an investigation leading to the arrest of the "Paintball 11" in Northern Virginia.⁴⁶
- 3. **August 2004**: James Elshafay and Shahwar Matin Siraj are arrested largely based on the controversial use of an informant in the investigation. However NYPD were first notified of Siraj after a Muslim community member anonymously notifies New York police about consistently troubling rhetoric coming from the suspect.⁴⁷
- 4. **February 2006**: Muslim community members in Ohio provide information help into arrest and eventually convict 3 suspects planning attacks in Iraq.⁴⁸
- 5. **August 2006**: British authorities arrest a group of British Muslim violent extremists suspected of plotting to blow up several airplanes over the Atlantic. Authorities first become aware of the plot based on a tip from a Muslim community member.⁴⁹
- **6. November 2006:** Adnan Babar Mirza, a Pakistani national studying in Houston, TX and is arrested for illegal firearms training and possession. Adnan come to the attention of the FBI when local Houston community members tip them off about Adnan's activities and alleged intentions. ⁵⁰
- 7. July 2009: Mosque leaders in Raleigh, North Carolina contact law enforcement to notify them of "violent, threatening action... considered to be dangerous" leading to the arrest of Daniel Boyd and 6 other individuals.⁵¹
- 8. **September 2009:** Queens Imam Ahmad Afazali, a community liaison to the NYPD, helps local police and the FBI in the investigation and arrest of suspect Najibullah Zazi. Though Zazi is initially accused of tipping off Zazi to police surveillance, information in the court complaint⁵² and corroborating reporting from mainstream media sources⁵³ found this notion to be false. (Afzali was, however, deported on charges of lying to FBI agents, but subsequent media reporting also strengthens Afzali's claims that he was scapegoat for getting caught up in a turf battle between NYPD and FBI officials.)⁵⁴
- 9. **November 2009**: Five Virginia Muslim youth are arrested in Pakistan, allegedly seeking to join a terrorist group, after family members told American federal authorities they went missing.⁵⁵
- 10. **April 2010**: Senegalese Muslim Alioune Niass first spots the suspicious vehicle used as a bomb to attack Times Square in New York City. Clues from the vehicle and defused explosive immediately led to the suspect, Faisal Shahzad's, arrest. ⁵⁶
- 11. **June 2010**: Suspects Mohammed Mahmoud Alessa and Carlos Eduardo Almonte are arrested, after the FBI first receives an anonymous report in 2006 from one of the suspects' family members. News reports indicate one of Alessa's family members provided the tip.⁵⁷

- 12. **October 2010**: Former Hawaii resident Abdel Hamid Shehadeh is arrested for attempting to join the Taliban. Local media noted that the Muslim Association of Hawaii "assisted law enforcement agencies in the case" and that it has "in the past reported suspicious activities." ⁵⁸
- 13. **October 2010**: Farooque Ahmed is arrested on charges of allegedly attempting to bomb the Washington, DC metro railway system. The FBI first learns of Ahmed's intentions from a community tip-off.⁵⁹
- 14. **October 2010**: An attempt by Al-Qaeda in the Arabian Peninsula to bomb Western targets using air cargo transportation is prevented by US and European authorities. Intelligence that prevented the plot came from ex-militant Jabr al-Faifi, who voluntarily handed himself into Saudi authorities.⁶⁰
- 15. **November 2010**: Mohamed Osman Mohamud is arrested for attempting to bomb a Christmas tree-lighting ceremony in Portland, Oregon. The New York Times notes, "In the Oregon [Mohamud] case, the FBI received a tip from a Portland Muslim." 61
- 16. **December 2010**: Antonio Martinez is arrested for attempting to bomb a military recruiting center in Maryland. Statements from Justice Department officials indicate a Muslim community member reported Martinez to the FBI during its ongoing investigation.⁶²
- 17. **June 2011:** Two Al-Qaeda inspired violent criminals planning to attack a military installation in Seattle are arrested by law enforcement. FBI officials first become aware of the planned attack after a fellow Muslim who was trying to be recruited into the conspiracy went to Seattle Police and informed them of the plot.⁶³
- 18. **July 2011**: Uzbek national Ulugbek Kodirov was arrested for threatening to kill President Barack Obama and possession of illegal firearms and explosives. U.S. Attorney Joyce Vance expressed her "appreciation to the Muslim community of Birmingham, which was instrumental in helping law enforcement to shut down this threat."
- 19. **January 2012**: Violent Al-Qaeda sympathizer Sami Osmakac is arrested for planning to attack several sites in Tampa, Florida using guns and explosives. The U.S. Attorney for Central Florida noted, "This investigation was also predicated, in part, by assistance from the Muslim community." 65

Despite the numerous legal and social challenges Muslim Americans face at times, the above list shows the critical role their communities play in keeping America safe. This totals 19 post-9/11 plots involving anti-terror assistance from Muslim community members.

This does not include two notable cases where Muslim gave vital intelligence that was not used by security officials:

> Warnings from Umar Farouk Abdulmutallab's father⁶⁶

 Multiple tips from the Muslim wives of David Headley⁶⁷

Factoring in the latter two cases, there have been 21 total instances of Muslims voluntarily seeking to help law enforcement prevent Al Qaeda-related terror activities threatening the United States since 9/11. The represents over 1 out of every 3 (35%) cases.

When specifically focusing on American Muslims (rather than Muslims at-large) providing unsolicited tips to prevent "homegrown" terror plots, this amounts to 17 out 54 (31.4%) post-9/11 plots. In other words, American Muslims are responsible for providing initial unsolicited tips to law enforcement in nearly 1 out of every 3 Al-Qaeda related "homegrown" plots since 9/11.

It is important to note, however, that these numbers may be underestimating the level of cooperation. Whereas this research was conducted using open sources, information that may have come from community tips may tend to remain unrevealed due to law enforcement officials' desire to protect their sources of information.

Conclusion & Policy Recommendations

In order to develop a stronger defense against all terrorist threats, it is clear there must be better relations between law enforcement and citizens to enhance national vigilance. Closer coordination must also be developed between local, state, and federal law enforcement.

Therefore we offer the following recommendations:

Expand community-oriented policing initiatives. Those relationships require much effort and resources to maintain. Department of Justice's Office of Community Oriented Policing Services (COPS) – which recently allocated \$1 billion in stimulus money from Congress can serve as an important resource by providing technical resources and information on best practices.⁶⁸ Congress and the White House should continue to increase its support for COPS.

- Increase support for research⁶⁹ and training⁷⁰ to combat biased law enforcement practices. As MPAC's data demonstrates, terrorism against the United States is not limited to Muslim violent extremists. Using false profiles to disproportionately focus on particular community is misallocation of resources ignores other risks at our nation's Enhanced research training to reduce biased policing is necessary to make our nation more secure against all terrorist threats.
- Expand investments in better human capital acquisition. The Security agencies' need more individuals, including Muslim Americans, with language subject matter expertise. Federal, state and local agencies should proactively seek to hire individuals with critical skill sets through job fairs and scholarships.⁷¹
- Highlight citizen contributions national security. Several examples, highlighted in this report show Muslim and non-Muslim communities actively step forward to notify authorities when they become aware of a violent threat. Doing so is particularly important for Muslim communities. They are also involved in several initiatives to combat extremist ideologies through various strategies in their communities.⁷² Informing the public of Muslim Americans' assistance will help allay public concerns about security and dispel unfounded stereotypes about communities. It will also strengthen relations

between law enforcement and citizens.

• Reform fusion center processes for better law enforcement coordination. The current network of fusion centers across the U.S. remains disjointed, despite sharing linked databases. These efforts need to be harmonized through an

empowered Office of the Program Manager of the Information Sharing Environment (PM-ISE). The PM-ISE should push regional and state fusion centers to incorporate aspects of community policing in their internal procedures through strengthened auditing protocols and establishing a community relations advisory boards.⁷⁴

Endnotes

.

(September 2011), P. 12. Available at:

http://www.lawandsecurity.org/Portals/0/Documents/TTRC%20Ten%20Year%20Issue.pdf.

¹ Report and data originally researched and directed by Alejandro J. Beutel, former MPAC Government and Policy Analyst (2009-2012). As of June 2012, Beutel is no longer involved in the development of this project.

project. ² "Who is a Terrorist? Government Failure to Define Terrorism Undermines Enforcement, Puts Civil Liberties at Risk." *Transactional Records Access Clearinghouse*, (September 27, 2009). Available at: http://trac.syr.edu/tracreports/terrorism/215/.

MPAC does not endorse the term *jihadist*, or similar religiously-laden terminology, seeing the use of such terms to imply a gross misunderstanding of Islamic values that is advocated by extremists such as Al-Qaeda and Osama Bin Laden. For an American Muslim critique of public officials and analysts using terminology, see: C. Welton Gaddy and Salam Al-Marayati, "Bin Laden's Personal Letters Reveal Muslims Are Part of the Solution to Securing the United States." *Washington Post*, (May 31, 2012). Available at: http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/guest-voices/post/bin-ladens-personal-letters-reveal-muslims-are-part-of-the-solution-to-securing-the-united-states/2012/05/31/gJQA1hwr4U_blog.html.

"Terrorist Trial Report Card: September 11, 2001-September 11, 2011." *Center for Law and Security*,

⁵ Daniel Michelson-Horowitz, "9/11 at 10: Inside the Terrorist Trial Report Card." *American Law Review*, (September 24, 2011). Available at: http://www.americancriminallawreview.com/Drupal/blogs/blog-entry/911-10-inside-terrorist-trial-report-card-09-24-2011.

⁶ "Terrorist Trial Report Card: September 11, 2001-September 11, 2009." *Center for Law and Security*, (January 2010), P. 10. Available at: http://www.lawandsecurity.org/publications/TTRCFinalJan14.pdf.
⁷ Ibid., P. 10.

⁸ "Terrorist Trial Report Card: September 11, 2001-September 11, 2011," P. 8.

⁹ Ibid., P. 8.

¹⁰ Ibid., P. 8.

¹¹ See the appendices for the statistical tables and sources.

¹² For instance, see: Walter Laqueur, "Terrorism: A Brief History." *E-Journal USA (U.S. Department of State)*, (May 11, 2007). Available at: http://www.america.gov/st/peacesec-english/2008/April/20080522172730SrepoD0.6634027.html

english/2008/April/20080522172730SrenoD0.6634027.html.

13 Joseph Simone Jr., Joshua D. Freilich, and Steven M. Chermak, "Surveying State Police Agencies about Domestic Terrorism and Far-Right Extremists." *University of Maryland Study of Terrorism and Responses to Terrorism*. (February 2008), Available at:

http://www.start.umd.edu/start/publications/research_briefs/20080221_state_agency_survey.pdf, P. 2. ¹⁴ Ibid., P. 2-3.

¹⁵ Ibid., P. 1.

¹⁶ See Appendix B for the statistical table and sources.

¹⁷ For instance, see: Rick "Ozzie" Nelson and Ben Bodurian, "A Growing Terrorist Threat? Assessing 'Homegrown Extremism' in the United States." *Center for International and Strategic Studies*, (March 8, 2010). Available at: www.csis.org/files/publication/100304 Nelson Growing Terrorist Threat Web.pdf; Bruce Hoffman, "American Jihad." *The National Interest*, (April 20, 2010). Available at: http://nationalinterest.org/article/american-jihad-3441; Bruce Hoffman, "American Jihad, Part II." *The National Interest*, (July 21, 2010). Available at: http://nationalinterest.org/commentary/american-jihad-part-ii-3680.

¹⁸ Mohamed Elibiary, "Working with Communities to Disrupt Terror Plots." *US House of Representatives Committee on Homeland Security*, (March 17, 2010). Available at: http://hsc.house.gov/SiteDocuments/20100317103442-74422.pdf, P.1.

¹⁹ Daniel Benjamin, "Why do Terrorists Love to Strike Around Elections?" *Brookings Institute*, (October 22, 2008). Available at: http://www.brookings.edu/opinions/2008/1022 terrorism benjamin.aspx.

Will McCants, "Jihadi Reactions to Election of Obama." Jihadica, (November 5, 2008). Available at: http://www.jihadica.com/jihad-reactions-to-election-of-obama/; Will McCants, "Zawahiri's Black Day." Jihadica, (November 19, 2008). Available at: http://www.jihadica.com/zawahiris-black-day/; Thomas Hegghammer, "Obama is More Dangerous Than Bush." Jihadica, (June 29, 2009). Available at: http://www.jihadica.com/obama-is-more-dangerous-than-bush/.

http://blog.newsweek.com/blogs/thegaggle/archive/2010/02/18/joseph-stack-and-right-wing-terror-isolatedincidents-or-worrying-trend.aspx.

²² "Analysis of the Bipartisan Policy Center Report, 'Assessing the Terrorist Threat.'" American Civil Liberties/Muslim Public Affairs Council/Muslim Advocates, (October 18, 2010). Available at: http://www.aclu.org/files/assets/ACLU Interested Persons Memo Regarding BPC Threat Assessment Report.pdf, P. 7.

²³ Charles Kurzman, "Muslim-American Terrorism Since 9/11: An Accounting." *Triangle Center on* Terrorism and Homeland Security, (February 2, 2011). Available at:

http://sanford.duke.edu/centers/tcths/about/documents/Kurzman Muslim-

American Terrorism Since 911 An Accounting.pdf. ²⁴ Ibid., P. 1.

²⁵ William Maclean, "Analysts View: Spotlight on Awlaki Killing." *Reuters*, (September 30, 2011). Available at: http://www.reuters.com/article/2011/09/30/us-yemen-awlaki-av-idUSTRE78T2X920110930.

²⁶ J.M. Berger, "The Enduring Appeal of Al-'Awlaqi's 'Constants on the Path of Jihad." CTC Sentinel, Vol. 4, No. 10, (October 2011), P. 12-15. Available at: http://www.ctc.usma.edu/wpcontent/uploads/2011/11/CTCSentinel-Vol4Iss104.pdf.

²⁷ Omar Sacirbey, "Dead Cleric's Videos May Find Eternal Life Online." Religion News Service, (October 6, 2011). Available at: http://www.christiancentury.org/article/2011-10/dead-clerics-videos-may-findeternal-life-online.

²⁸ Citing terrorism expert Marc Sageman. David Ignatius, "The Fading Jihadists." *Washington Post*, (February 28, 2008). Available at: http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-

dyn/content/article/2008/02/27/AR2008022703179.html.

²⁹ Daniel Byman and Christine Fair, "The Case for Calling Them Nitwits." *Atlantic Monthly*, (July/August 2010). Available at: http://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2010/07/the-case-for-calling-themnitwits/8130/.

³⁰ Citing MPAC Government Liaison and national security policy analyst Alejandro Beutel. Peter Katel, "Homegrown Terrorists; Can Muslim Terrorists in the U.S. Mount Serious Attacks?" CO Researcher, Vol. 20. No. 30. (September 3, 2010), P. 708, 709.

³¹ Ibid., P. 707.

³² "'Dr. Chaos' Waives Hearing on Subway Cyanide." *United Press International*, (March 14, 2002); "Self-Described Terrorist Charged in Chicago." Voice of America, (March 12, 2002). Available at: http://www.voanews.com/english/archive/2002-03/a-2002-03-12-18-Self-Described.cfm?moddate=2002-03-12.

³³ Michael Reynolds, "Homegrown Terror." *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists*, (November/December 2004), P. 48-57.

³⁴ Domestic Terrorism: Tip Leads to Sting, Prison for Plotter." Federal Bureau of Investigation, (November 29, 2006). Available at: http://www.fbi.gov/page2/nov06/terror112906.htm.

35 "(U) Domestic Terrorists' Intent and Capability to Use Chemical, Biological, Radiological, and Nuclear Weapons," Federal Bureau of Investigation/Department of Homeland Security, (October 14, 2008). Available at: http://info.publicintelligence.net/FBIdomesticcbrn.pdf; Denys Ray Hughes, "Survivalist Man Convicted of Attempting to Make Ricin on the Run." WSAW.com, (June 18, 2011). Available at: http://www.wsaw.com/home/headlines/Surivalist Man Convicted of Attempting to Make Ricin on the Run 124137064.html

³⁶ "(U) Domestic Terrorists' Intent and Capability to Use Chemical, Biological, Radiological, and Nuclear Weapons."

³⁷ FBI Field Intelligence Groups: 9 December Discovery of Radiological Dispersal Device, Components, Literature and Radioactive Material at the Maine Residence of an Identified Deceased US Person." Federal Bureau of Investigation, (December 9, 2008). Available at: http://www.splcenter.org/blog/wpcontent/uploads/2009/02/fbi maine021109.pdf.

³⁸ Bill Rankin, Christian Boone, and Katie Leslie, "Georgia Militia Plot: Affidavit Outlines Plans for Killings." Atlanta Constitution Journal, (November 2, 2011). Available at: http://www.ajc.com/news/atlanta/georgia-militia-plot-affidavit-1214918.html; "Judge Refuses Bond for

²¹ David A. Graham, "Joseph Stack and Right-Wing Terror: Isolated Incidents or Worrying Trend?" Newsweek, (February 18, 2010). Available at:

```
Ment Accused in Militia Plot." Associated Press, (November 16, 2011). Available at:
http://www.npr.org/2011/11/16/142424100/judge-refuses-bond-for-men-accused-in-militia-plot.
<sup>39</sup> Richard S. Hartunian, "Man Indicted for Chemical Weapons Offenses." U.S. Attorney's Office of the
Northern District of New York, (May 17, 2012). Available at: http://www.fbi.gov/albany/press-
releases/2012/man-indicted-for-chemical-weapons-offenses.
<sup>40</sup> Also see: Scott Stewart, "Profiling: Sketching the Face of Jihadism." Stratfor, (January 20, 2010).
Available at: http://www.stratfor.com/weekly/20100120 profiling sketching face jihadism.
<sup>41</sup> John Horgan, "From Profiles to Pathways: The Road to Recruitment." E-Journal USA (U.S. Department
of State), (May 11, 2007). Available at: http://www.america.gov/st/peacesec-
english/2007/May/20080522173120SrenoD0.3425867.html; Craig Whitlock, "Terrorists Proving Harder to
Profile." Washington Post, (March 12, 2007). Available at: http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-
dyn/content/article/2007/03/11/AR2007031101618.html; "Will Profiling Make a Difference?" New York
Times, (January 4, 2010). Available at: http://roomfordebate.blogs.nytimes.com/2010/01/04/will-profiling-
make-a-difference/; Garrine P. Laney, "Racial Profiling: Issues and Federal Legislative Proposals and
Options." Congressional Research Service, (February, 17, 2004). Available at:
http://www.law.umaryland.edu/marshall/crsreports/crsdocuments/RL32231_02172004.pdf, P. 5-7.
  "Community Policing Defined." US Department of Justice, (December 15, 2009). Available at:
http://www.cops.usdoi.gov/Default.asp?Item=36.
<sup>43</sup> Yili Xu, Mora L. Fiedler, and Karl H. Flaming, "Discovering the Impact of Community Policing:
Discovering the Broken Windows Thesis, Collective Efficacy, and Citizens' Judgment." Journal of
Research in Crime and Delinquency, Vol. 42, No. 2, (May 2005), P. 147-186.
<sup>44</sup> Dennis L Jensen, Enhancing Homeland Security Efforts by Building Strong Relationships Between the
Muslim Community and Local Law Enforcement." Naval Postgraduate School, (March 2006). Available
at: http://edocs.nps.edu/npspubs/scholarly/theses/2006/Mar/06Mar Jensen.pdf; William McCormack,
"State and Local Law Enforcement: Contributions to Terrorism Prevention." FBI Law Enforcement
Bulletin, (March 2009). Available at: http://www.fbi.gov/publications/leb/2009/march2009/terrorism.htm.
For an international perspective, see: "Australia: Community Policing to Fight Terrorism Down Under."
Security Management, (June 27, 2007). Available at: http://www.securitymanagement.com/news/australia-
community-policing-fight-terrorism-down-under; "Community Policing the Best Way to Fight Terrorism."
Australia Broadcast Corporation, (October 15, 2007). Available at:
http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2007/10/15/2059628.htm.
45 "Complete 911 Timeline: 'Lackwanna Six.'" History Commons, (N.D.). Available at:
http://www.historycommons.org/timeline.jsp?complete 911 timeline al qaeda by region=complete 911
timeline lackawanna six &timeline=complete 911 timeline.

46 Mary Beth Sheridan, "Hardball Tactics in an Era of Threats." Washington Post, (September 3, 2006).
Available at: http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-
dyn/content/article/2006/09/02/AR2006090201096 pf.html.
<sup>47</sup> Craig Horowitz, "Anatomy of a Foiled Plot." New York Magazine, (May 21, 2005). Available at:
http://nymag.com/nymetro/news/features/10559/.
<sup>48</sup> Mike Wilkinson and Christina Hall, "3 Charged in Terror Plot; Local Suspects Planned Attacks in Iraq."
Toledo Blade, (February 22, 2006). Available at:
http://www.toledoblade.com/apps/pbcs.dll/article?AID=/20060222/NEWS03/60222005.
<sup>49</sup> Craig Whitlock and Dafna Linzer, "Tip Followed '05 Attacks on London Transit." Washington Post,
(August 11, 2006). Available at: http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-
```

⁵⁰ Arun Kundnani, "The FBI's 'Good' Muslims." Agence Global, (September 1, 2011). Available at: http://www.agenceglobal.com/article.asp?id=2629.

dyn/content/article/2006/08/10/AR2006081001654.html.

⁵¹ Sheyenne Rodriguez, "Leaders Speak Out About Terror Arrests." WTVD-TV, (August 2, 2009). Available at: http://abclocal.go.com/wtvd/story?section=news/local&id=6944847.

⁵² Garrett Gumbinner, "Criminal Complaint United States v. Najibullah Zazi." United States Department of Justice, (September 19, 2009). Available at: http://www.9news.com/pdfs/N.Zazi.pdf, P. 5-6.

⁵³ Eileen Sullivan, "FBI to Senators: Terror Case Wasn't Damaged." Associated Press, (September 30, 2009). Available at: http://wire.antiwar.com/2009/09/30/fbi-to-senators-terror-case-wasnt-damaged/; A.G. Sulzberger, "Imam and Informant Tells Why He Lied." New York Times, (April 15, 2010). Available at: http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/16/nyregion/16imam.html? r=1.

http://www.democracynow.org/2010/5/6/muslim vendor gets no credit in; "Who is the Real 'Hero of Times Square'?" The Week, (May 3, 2010). Available at:

http://theweek.com/article/index/202564/Who is the real Hero of Times Square.

⁵⁷ Noam N. Levey and Geraldine Baum, "Two N.J. Men Arrested at JFK on Terrorism Charges." Los Angeles Times, (June 7, 2010). Available at: http://articles.latimes.com/2010/jun/07/nation/la-na-njterrorism-20100607/2; "Fathers of N.J. Suspects Face First Court Day of International Terrorism Case." Newark Star-Ledger, (June 8, 2010). Available at:

http://www.nj.com/news/index.ssf/2010/06/fathers of nj terror suspects.html.

⁵⁸ Gary T. Kubota, "FBI Terror Case Aided by Hawaii Muslims." *Honolulu Star Advertiser*, (October 27, 2010). Available at:

http://www.staradvertiser.com/news/hawaiinews/20101027 FBI terror case aided by Hawaii Muslims.h

⁵⁹ Matt Apuzzo and Adam Goldman. "Officials: Muslim Source Turned in Terror Suspect." Associated Press, (October 28, 2010). Available at: http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/39894024/from/toolbar.

⁶⁰ Dan Murphy, "Who Saved the Day in Yemen Bomb Plot? Once Again, A Muslim." Christian Science Monitor, (November 2, 2010). Available at: http://www.csmonitor.com/World/Middle-

East/2010/1102/Who-saved-the-day-in-Yemen-bomb-plot-Once-again-a-Muslim; "Wanted Saudi Al-Qaida Operative Surrenders to Saudi Authorities." Associated Press, (October 19, 2010). Available at: http://tinyurl.com/4whauwy; "Al-Qaeda Suspect Surrenders." Agence France Presse, (October 15, 2010), Available at: http://www.nation.co.ke/News/world/A1%20Qaeda%20suspect%20surrenders/-

/1068/1033766/-/9pvqofz/-/; Hamza Hendawi and Ahmed Al-Haj, "Yemen: Al-Qaida Insider Told Saudis of Bomb Plot." Associated Press, (November 1, 2010). Available at: http://tinyurl.com/46u4qac.

⁶¹ Liz Robbins and Edward Hyatt, "Bomb Plot Foiled at Holiday Event in Oregon." New York Times, (November 28, 2010). Available at: http://www.post-gazette.com/pg/10332/1106671-84.stm.

62 "Post-9/11 Jihadist Terrorism Cases Involving U.S. Citizens and Residents: An Overview." New America Foundation/Syracuse University Maxwell School of Public Policy, (March 2011). Available at: http://homegrown.newamerica.net/sites/homegrown.newamerica.net/files/Homegrown Terrorism Narrativ e.pdf, P. 4.; Charles Kurzman, "Muslim-American Terrorism Since 9/11: An Accounting." University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, (February 2, 2011). Available at:

http://sanford.duke.edu/centers/tcths/about/documents/Kurzman Muslim-

American Terrorism Since 911 An Accounting.pdf, P. 6.

63 "Informant Who Divulged Terror Plot to FBI is a Convicted Felon." KING 5.com, (June 24, 2011). Available at: http://www.king5.com/home/Informant-who-divulged-terror-plot-to-FBI-is-a-convictedfelon-124511549.html.

64 "Uzbek National Pleads Guilty to Charges Threatening to Kill the President and Providing Material Support to Terrorist Activity." Federal Bureau of Investigation, (February 2012). Available at: http://l.usa.gov/yFtVBF; "Illegal Alien from Uzbekistan Indicted for Threatening to Kill the President and Possessing Machine Gun and Grenades." Federal Bureau of Investigation, (July 26, 2011). Available at: http://1.usa.gov/HEuH4r.

65 "Florida Resident Charged with Plotting to Bomb Locations in Tampa." U.S. Department of Justice, (January 9, 2012). Available at: http://www.justice.gov/usao/flm/press/2012/jan/20120109_Osmakac.html. Father of Terror Suspect Reportedly Warned U.S. About Son." Fox News, (December 26, 2009). Available at: http://www.foxnews.com/us/2009/12/26/father-terror-suspect-reportedly-warned-son-1857952999/.

⁶⁷ Sebastian Rotella, "FBI Was Warned Years in Advance of Mumbai Attacker's Terror Ties." *ProPublica*, (October 15, 2010). Available at: http://www.propublica.org/article/mumbai-plot-fbi-was-warned-years-inadvance; Sebastian Rotella, "Newly Discovered Warnings About David Headley Reveal a Troubling Timeline in Mumbai Case." ProPublica, (November 5, 2010). Available at: http://www.propublica.org/article/newly-discovered-warnings-about-headley-reveal-a-troubling-timelinein-mumb.

⁵⁴ Sulzberger, "Imam and Informant Tells"

⁵⁵ Scott Shane, "Pakistan Detains Five Americans in Raid Tied to Militants." New York Times, (December 9, 2009). Available at: http://www.nytimes.com/2009/12/10/world/asia/10inquire.html.

⁵⁶ Amy Goodman and Juan Gonzalez, "Muslim Vendor Gets No Credit in Helping to Foil Times Square Bomb Plot." Democracy Now!, (May 6, 2010). Available at:

http://www.cops.usdoj.gov/html/dispatch/February_2009/biased_policing.htm.

⁷² For instance see: David Schanzer, Charles Kurzman, and Ebrahim Moosa, "Anti-Terror Lessons of Muslim-Americans." *Duke University Sanford School of Public Policy*, (January 6, 2010). Available at: http://www.sanford.duke.edu/news/Schanzer Kurzman Moosa Anti-Terror Lessons.pdf.

⁷³ For further discussion, see: Mark A. Randol, "Terrorism Information Sharing and the Nationwide Suspicious Activity Report Initiative: Background and Issues for Congress." *Congressional Research Service*, (November 5, 2009). Available at: http://assets.opencrs.com/rpts/R40901 20091105.pdf.

⁶⁸ "COPS FY 2009 Funding." *Department of Justice Office of Community Oriented Policing Services*, (December 8, 2009). Available at: http://www.cops.usdoj.gov/Default.asp?Item=46.

⁶⁹ One prominent example of ongoing research to reduce biased policing is the Consortium for Police Leadership in Equity, based at the University of California Los Angeles. See: http://cple.psych.ucla.edu/. Lorie Fridell and Anna T. Laszlo, "Reducing Biased Policing Through Better Training." *Community Police Dispatch*, Vol. 2, No. 2, (February 2009). Available at:

⁷¹ Matthew Lysakowski, Albert Antony Pearsall III, and Jill Pope, "Policing in New Immigrant Communities." *US Department of Justice Office of Community Oriented Policing Services*, (June 2009), http://www.vera.org/download?file=2889/e060924209-NewImmigrantCommunities.pdf. P. 8-10.

Interview with Mohamed Elibiary, dated 10/15/09. Elibiary is the CEO and President of the Freedom and Justice Foundation (F&J). F&J is an educational non-profit working to enhance Centrist Public Policy development and implementation through the civic and interfaith engagement of Texas Muslims. See: www.freeandjust.org.



Post 9/11 Terrorism Incident Database

Appendix A: Statistical Table of Muslim Terrorism Incidents Against the United States Since 9/11/01

	Name	Date of Arrest/Attack	Ideology	Implemented/ Prevented	Operational Stage?	# of Deaths	CBRN
1.	Richard Reid	12/2001	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
2.	Jose Padilla	5/8/2002	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
3.	Imran Mandhai and Shueyb Jokhan	5/18/2002	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
4.	Hesham Mohamed Hedayet	7/2002	Muslim Extremist	Implemented	Yes	2	
5.	"Lackawanna 6"	9/2002	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
6.	Iyman Faris	3/2003	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
7.	"Virginia Jihad Network/11"	6/2003	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
8.	Dhiren Barot	8/2004	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
9.	James ElShafay/ Shahawar Siraj	8/2004	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
10.	Yassin M. Aref/ Mohammed M. Hossain	8/2004	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
11.	Hamid Hayat	6/2005	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
12.	Jamaat us-Saheeh (4 people)	8/2005	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
13.	Mohammad Amawi, Marwan Othman Al-Hindi, Wassim Mazloum	2/2006	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
14.	Mohammed Taheri-Azar	3/2006	Muslim Extremist	Implemented	Yes	0	
15.	Ehsanul Islam Sadequee and Syed Haris Ahmed	4/2006	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
16.	Assem Hammoud	7/2006	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
17.	Naveed Haq	7/28/2006	Muslim Extremist	Implemented	Yes	1	
18.	Transatlantic Bomb Plot	8/2006	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
19.	Adnan Mirza	11/28/2006	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
20.	Daniel Maldonado	1/2007	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
21.	Fort Dix, NJ Plot	5/7/2007	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
22.	JFK Airport Plot	6/2/2007	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
23.	Mohammed Jabarah	1/2008	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
24.	Christopher Paul	6/2008	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
25.	Bryant Neal Vinas	11/2008	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
26.	"Newburgh Four"	5/20/2009	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
27.	Abdulhakim Mujahid Muhammad	6/1/2009	Muslim Extremist	Implemented	Yes	1	
28.	"North Carolina 7"	7/27/2009	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	

29.	Michael Finton	9/16/2009	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
30.	Hosam Smadi	9/17/2009	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
31.	Najibullah Zazi	9/19/2009	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
32.	Colleen LaRose	10/2009	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
33.	Tarek Mehanna	10/21/2009	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
34.	Nidal Hasan	11/6/2009	Muslim Extremist	Implemented	Yes	13	
35.	"Virginia 5"	12/10/09	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
36.	Umar Farouk Abdulmuttallab	12/25/09	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
37.	Faisal Shahzad	4/30/2010	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
38.	Mohamed Mahmood Alessa & Carlos Eduardo Almonte	6/6/2010	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
39.	Zachary Chesser	7/21/2010	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
40.	Paul G. Rockwood	7/21/2010	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
41.	Shaker Masri	8/3/2010	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
42.	Abdel Hameed Shehadeh	10/26/2010	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
43.	Farooque Ahmed	10/28/2010	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
44.	"Air Cargo Bomb Plot"/ Ibrahim Hassan Al-Asiri(?)	10/29/2010	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
45.	Mohamed Osman Mohamud	11/27/2010	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
46.	Craig Baxam	12/2011	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	No	0	
47.	Antonio Martinez	12/8/2010	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
48.	Emerson Begolly	01/04/2011	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
49.	Roger Stockham	01/24/2011	Muslim Extremist (Anti-Shia)	Prevented	Yes	0	
50.	Khalid Al-Dawsari	2/24/2011	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
51.	Waad Alwan	5/30/2011	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
52.	Abu Khalid Abdul-Latif & Walli Mujahidh	6/23/2011	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
53.	Ulugbek Kodirov	07/2011	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
54.	Naser Jason Abdo	7/28/2011	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
55.	Mansour Arbabsiar	09/2011	Muslim Extremist (Iranian)	Prevented	No	0	
56.	Rezwan Ferdaus	9/26/2011	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
57.	Jose Pimentel	11/21/11	Muslim Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	

58.	Sami Osmakac	1/7/2012	Muslim	Prevented	Yes	0	
			Extremist				
59.	Amine El-Khalifi	02/2012	Muslim	Prevented	Yes	0	
			Extremist				
60.	Ibrahim Hassan Al-Asiri (2)	5/2012	Muslim	Prevented	Yes	0	
			Extremist				
	Totals						
	60 incidents/plots	-	-	5	47	17	0 cases
				Implemented/	Operational/	deaths	
				55 Prevented	13		
					Aspirational		

<u>Definitions and Research Parameters</u>: All entries were specifically chosen because they fit this report's definition of *violent extremism*. The term violent extremism, in our view, is synonymous with the term "terrorism." We define violent extremism based on Title 28 Section 0.85 of the U.S. Code of Federal Regulations, "the unlawful use of force and violence against persons or property to intimidate or coerce a government, the civilian population, or any segment thereof, in furtherance of political or social objectives." This replaces the Database's earlier definition which was: "A criminal act inspired by political ideology that seeks to employ violence against unarmed human "civilians" (as defined by the Geneva Conventions)."

Incidents involving so-called "eco-terrorists" tend to be excluded because they mostly target property rather than humans and is perhaps better termed as "eco-sabotage".

Furthermore the Database does not examine directly non-violent, but problematic legal offenses such as material support provisions. Database research specifically examines violations of the law involving violent offenses such as murder, engaging in terrorism training, engaging in terrorism and illicit possession of firearms, explosives and other "weapons of mass destruction", as statutorily defined under U.S. federal and state criminal laws.

A terrorist plot is considered to reach "operational" stage if the suspected individuals have possessed or attempted to possess "weapons" for an attack by the time of their arrest and/or attack. "Weapons" are put in quotations because this database also categorizes individuals such as the "Newburgh Four" as having reached the operational stage, yet the materials given to them during the sting operation leading to their arrests were fake explosives. If no possession or attempted possession of weapons taken place, the plot is categorized as "aspirational".

When the "United States" is mentioned, this is in reference to the American homeland, specifically the 50 federated states of the United States of America that share sovereignty with federal government, the District of Columbia and the unincorporated territories of the United States – specifically American Samoa, Guam, the Northern Mariana Islands, Puerto Rico and United States Virgin Islands.

For the purposes of conceptual clarity, we define a "Muslim" as a person who belongs to one of the eight major Islamic major schools of thought represented as a signatory to the *Amman Message*. We use this as our metric because for defining a "Muslim" because the *Amman Message* document reflects a rare modern-day cross-sectarian consensus. Any Islamic school of thought not represented in the document would be entered into our non-Muslim category. For more about the *Amman Message*, see: www.ammanmessage.com.

Plots entered into the Database are described as "threatening" the United States. Many of the plots accounted for in the Database are American citizens or legal permanent residents who do not directly target the "United States" (as defined above), rather they join or seek to join terrorist groups that may target Americans abroad. Nonetheless these plots are included because transnational war volunteers – also referred to as "Muslim Foreign Fighters" by former Harvard Kennedy School Fellow Thomas Hegghammer, end up becoming a significant source of recruitment for Al-Qaeda operatives to strike at Western countries and interests, including the United

States, later in their militant careers. As Hegghamer describes, "In the short term, Muslim foreign fighters pose a limited threat to the West, but in the long term they fuel international terrorism. Not all foreign fighters become al-Qaida operatives, but most al-Qaida operatives start as foreign fighters." See: Thomas Hegghamer, "The Foreign Fighter Phenomenon: Islam and Transnational Militancy." *Harvard University Kennedy School of Government*, (February 2011). Available at:

http://belfercenter.ksg.harvard.edu/files/Hegghammer_policy_brief_feb_2011.pdf.

Finally we define a "community tip" as any self-described "Muslim" (as defined above) who *voluntarily* submits information to any law enforcement and/or intelligence agency related to the prevention of a terrorist plot and is not employed as an informant for a law enforcement and/or intelligence agency in an official capacity due to agreement based on financial payment and/or legal coercion.

<u>Note on data categorizing</u>: All data entries in *italics* represent incidents/plots occurring after Barack Obama's 2008 Presidential election victory.

Note on incidents involving possible mental health issues: Though some analysts speculate that the alleged mental health issues of Jared Lee Loughner, accused of shooting Rep. Gabrielle Giffords (D-AZ) and killing 6 others, may have heavily influenced his motive behind the shooting, the possible presence of mental health issues, per se, does not altogether exempt the case from being classified as a terrorist act, given that there also appears to be political motives, such as Sovereign Citizen beliefs according the domestic extremism expert J.J. McNab, behind the attack. See: Janet Novak, "Expert: Loughner Rants Sound Like Sovereign Citizen Beliefs." *Forbes.com*, (January 12, 2011). Available at: http://www.forbes.com/sites/janetnovack/2011/01/12/expert-loughner-rants-sound-like-sovereign-citizen-beliefs/.

Similarly some have noted the presence of mental health issues and possible workplace grievances as motivating factors in Bruce Ivins presumed bio-terrorism anthrax attacks. However, the supporting affidavit in support of the search warrant for Ivin's residence also noted that he held political and religious grievances against members of the U.S. Senate who supported pro-choice laws and opposed the USA PATRIOT Act.

We have decided to enter both cases into our Database. The examples of "DC Sniper" John Allen Muhammad and anti-abortion militant Scott Roeder both involved clearly stated political motives that also allow their cases to be classified as terrorist acts, despite the existence of mental health issues.

This position has also been supported by RAND terrorism expert Brian Michael Jenkins and Senate Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs Committee Chairman Joseph Lieberman. See: "The Fort Hood Attack: A Preliminary Assessment." *Senate Committee on Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs*, (November 19, 2009). Available at:

http://www.senate.gov/fplayers/I2009/urlPlayer.cfm?fn=govtaff111909&st=960&dur=10050. (Specific remarks by Mr. Jenkins and Senate Lieberman begin at 96:00 mark.)

Note on Waad Alwan: Only Waad Alwan is listed in the Database, excluding his alleged co-conspirator Mohanad Shareef Hammadi because according to a Federal affidavit the former is charged with attempted murder and violence through terrorism, whereas the latter is only accused of material support. For more information on the court charges, see: http://www.lawfareblog.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/05/Unsealed-Alwan-Hammadi-Indictment.pdf.

Update, 4/13/2010: The case of Raja Lahrasib Khan has been removed from MPAC's Database. Although the original criminal complaint contained an allegation of some sort of involvement in planning an attack against an unspecified Chicago sports stadium – which would merit Khan's inclusion in MPAC's Database – the U.S. Government's formal indictment does not include that among the charges. According to an Associated Press story, "The indictment says nothing about an attack on a stadium. It merely says Khan twice sent money

intended as aid for Osama bin Laden's terrorist network." Source: Mike Robinson, "Raja Lahrasib Khan, Chicago Taxi Driver, Pleads Not Guilty To Aiding Al Qaeda." *Associated Press*, (April 5, 2010). Available at: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2010/04/05/raja-lahrasib-khan-chicag 0 n 525673.html.

Update, 8/23/2011: The case of Ahmed Ferhani and Mohamed Mamdouh is removed from the Database. Although the original criminal complaint from the State of New York contained an allegation of attempting to kill Jews and possibly bomb the Empire State Building – which would merit Ferhani and Mamdouh's inclusion into the Database – a New York State's formal grand jury indictment does not include that among the charges. According to a New York Times story, "The state grand jury that heard evidence against the men declined to indict them on the charges of second-degree conspiracy as a crime of terrorism and as a hate crime, rejecting the prosecution's assertion that they had plotted to blow up synagogues while there were worshippers inside. Instead, the panel favored lesser charges that suggested that the defendants, at best, had wanted to destroy a synagogue when it was empty." Source: William K. Rashbaum and Colin Moynihan, "Most Serious Charges Rejected Terror Case." New York Times, (June 15. in 2011). Available http://www.nytimes.com/2011/06/16/nyregion/most-serious-charges-rejected-in-synagogue-bombplot.html? r=1.

Sources for main Muslim extremist statistical table: Jena Baker McNeill and James Jay Carafano, "Terrorist Watch: 23 Plots Foiled Since 9/11." Heritage Foundation, (July 2, 2009). Available at: http://www.heritage.org/Research/HomelandSecurity/bg2294.cfm; Jena Baker McNeill and James Jay Carafano, "26 Foiled Terror Plots Show Success of Information Sharing." *Heritage Foundation*, (September 29, 2009). Available at: http://www.heritage.org/Research/HomelandSecurity/wm2634.cfm; Jena Baker McNeill, "Another Terror Plot Foiled: 27 Since 9/11." Heritage Foundation, (October 21, 2009). Available at: http://www.heritage.org/Research/HomelandSecurity/wm2663a.cfm; Jena Baker McNeill, "Detroit Terror Plot Makes 28 Plots Foiled Since 9/11." Heritage Foundation, (December 26, 2009). Available at: http://www.heritage.org/Research/HomelandSecurity/wm2741.cfm; Jena McNeill Baker, James Carafano, and Jessica Zuckerman, "30 Terrorist Plots Foiled: How the System Worked." Heritage Foundation, (April 29, 2010). Available at: http://www.heritage.org/Research/Reports/2010/04/30-Terrorist-Plots-Foiled-How-the-System-Worked; Jerome P. Bjelopera and Mark Randol, "American Jihadist Terrorism: Combating a Complex Threat." Congressional Research Service, (December 7, 2010). Available at: P. 67-124. Claire Suddath, "Bryant Neal Vinas: An American in Al Qaeda." TIME, (July 24, 2009). Available at: http://www.time.com/time/nation/article/0,8599,1912512,00.html; Kelcey Carson, "Taheri-Azar Wanted to Punish U.S. Gov't, He Says in 911 Call." WRAL.com, (March 6, 2006). Available at: http://www.wral.com/news/local/story/1091484/; "Pakistan Arrests 5 Men Reported Missing in United States." CNN, (December 10, 2009). Available at: http://www.cnn.com/2009/WORLD/asiapcf/12/09/pakistan.arrests/index.html; Abby Goodnough and Liz Robbins, "Mass, Man Arrested in Terrorism Case," New York Times, (October 21, 2009), Available at: http://www.nytimes.com/2009/10/22/us/22terror.html; Dina Temple-Raston, "'JihadJane' Creates a Calamity for Authorities." National Public Radio, (March 10, 2010). Available at: http://www.scpr.org/news/2010/03/10/jihad-jane-creates-a-calamity-for-authorities/, Alison Gendar, James Gordon Meek, Rocco Parascandola, Corky Siemaszko, "Pakistani-American Faisal Shahzad, Suspect in Foiled Times Square Bomb Plot, Arrested." New York Daily News, (May 4, 2010). Available at: http://www.nydailynews.com/ny local/2010/05/03/2010-05-03 times square car bomb square evidence points to overseas terrorist involvement w.html; Jeff Shields and Tanya Weinberg, "2 Muslims Indicted in 4 Bomb Plots." Orlando Sentinel, (May 18, 2002). Available at: http://articles.orlandosentinel.com/2002-05-18/news/0205180353 1 armory-fort-lauderdale-power-station;

Brian Ross and Vic Walter, "FBI Informant Says Agent Missed Chance to Stop 9/11 Ringleader Mohammed Atta." *ABC News*, (September 10, 2009). Available at: http://abcnews.go.com/Blotter/Whistleblowers/911-ringleader-mohammed-atta-stopped-fbi-informant/story?id=8540605; "Feds Tracked N.J. Terror Suspects for

```
2010). Available at: http://www.nytimes.com/2010/07/22/us/22terror.html. Don Babwin, "Shaker Masri Terror
Plot: Chicago Man Accused of Attempting to Aid Al Qaida." Associated Press, (August 4, 2010). Available at:
http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2010/08/04/shaker-masri-terror-plot- n 670679.html; "Washington Subway
System Targeted in Plot." Associated Press, Washington Post, and New York Times, (October 28, 2010).
Available at: http://www.dallasnews.com/sharedcontent/dws/news/nation/stories/DN-
terror 28nat.ART.State.Edition1.477ebbb.html; Scott Shane, "U.S. Hunts for More Suspicious Packages." New
York Times, (October 29, 2010). Available at:
http://www.nytimes.com/2010/10/30/us/30plane.html? r=1&partner=rss&emc=rss; Dan Murphy, "AQAP
Bombmaker Ibrahim Hassan Al-Asiri Emerges as Key Yemen Suspect." Christian Science Monitor, (November
2, 2010). Available at: http://www.csmonitor.com/World/Middle-East/2010/1102/AQAP-bombmaker-Ibrahim-
Hassan-al-Asiri-emerges-as-key-Yemen-suspect; Bryan Denson, "FBI Thwarts Terrorist Bombing Attempt at
Portland Holiday Tree Lighting, Authorities Say." The Oregonian, (November 26, 2010). Available at:
http://www.oregonlive.com/portland/index.ssf/2010/11/fbi thwarts terrorist bombing.html; Bruce Goldfarb,
"Federal Agents Describe Case Against Antonio Martinez." Arbutus Patch, (December 8, 2010). Available at:
http://arbutus.patch.com/articles/federal-agents-describe-case-against-martinez; "Justice, FBI: Los Angeles
Airport Shooting was an Act of Terror." CNN, (April 12, 2003). Available at: http://articles.cnn.com/2003-04-
12/justice/airport.shooting 1 federal-investigators-israelis-terror? s=PM:LAW; Donald J. DeGabrielle, "US
Citizen Sentenced to Prison for Receiving Military Training from a Terrorist Organization." Department of
Justice, (July 20, 2007). Available at:
http://web.archive.org/web/20071020032329/http://houston.fbi.gov/dojpressrel/pressrel07/houston072007.htm;
Gary T. Kubota, "FBI Terror Case Aided by Hawaii Muslims." Honolulu Star Advertiser, (October 27, 2010).
Available at:
http://www.staradvertiser.com/news/hawaiinews/20101027 FBI terror case aided by Hawaii Muslims.html;
Alison Gendar, Michael J. Feeney, Corky Siemaszko, "Abdel Hameed Shehadeh, Wannabe Jihadi from Staten
Island, was on Feds' Radar Two Years Ago." New York Daily News, (October 26, 2010). Available at:
http://www.nydailynews.com/ny local/2010/10/26/2010-10-
26 abdel hameed shehadeh wannabe jihadi from staten island was on feds radar two ye.html; Khalid
Al-Dawsari, "Texas Student Khalid Aldawsari Arrested on Terror Charges; Targeted George W. Bush." ABC
News, (February 24, 2011). Available at: http://abcnews.go.com/Politics/texan-charged-plans-bomb-bush-
home-dams-nuclear/story?id=12990927; Lauren Cox, "Fort Hood Motive Terrorism or Mental Illness?" ABC
News, (November 9, 2009). Available at: http://abcnews.go.com/print?id=9019410. Julie Gerstein, "Two
Arrested in Synagogue Bomb Plot" New York Magazine, (May 13, 2011). Available at:
http://nymag.com/daily/intel/2011/05/two arrested in synagogue bomb.html; "Iraqi in Kentucky boasted of
IED attacks." CBS News, (June 1, 2011). Available at:
http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2011/06/01/national/main20067851.shtml; Jeremy Pelofsky, "UPDATE 2 –
Two Arrested in Seattle in Plot Against Military." Reuters, (June 23, 2011). Available at:
http://www.reuters.com/article/2011/06/23/usa-security-seattle-idUSN1E75M1U020110623: "Official: Soldier
Said He Wanted to Attack Fort Hood Troops." CNN, (July 28, 2011). Available at: http://articles.cnn.com/2011-
07-28/justice/fort.hood.arrest 1 nidal-hasan-guns-galore-abdo? s=PM:CRIME. "United States of America vs
Adnan Babar Mirza." United States District Court Southern District of Texas Houston Division, (September 19,
2007). Available at: http://www.investigativeproject.org/documents/case_docs/1203.pdf; "People of the State
of New York against Jose Pimentel aka Muhammad Yusuf." Criminal Court of the City of New York,
(November 20, 2011). Available at: http://www.scribd.com/doc/73312755/Jose-Pimentel-Complaint; "Florida
Resident Charged with Plotting to Bomb Locations in Tampa." U.S. Department of Justice, (January 9, 2012).
Available at: http://www.justice.gov/usao/flm/press/2012/jan/20120109 Osmakac.html; Former US soldier
Craig Baxam 'help al-Shabab'." BBC News, (January 9<sup>th</sup>, 2012). Available at
http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-us-canada-16478853
Agron Hasbajrami Charged in Plot to Join Pakistani Jihad Group." Huffington Post, (September 9<sup>th</sup>, 2011).
```

Available at http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/09/09/agron-hasbajrami-charged- n 955903.html

Federal agents arrest Amine El-Khalifi; he allegedly planned to bomb Capitol." *The Washington Post*, (February 17th, 2012). Available at http://www.nte.ie/news/2012/0210/obama.html?view=print?view=print; (February 10th, 2012) Available at http://www.rte.ie/news/2012/0210/obama.html?view=print?view=print; "Online statements, arsenal of weapons keep suspect in jail." *Post-Gazette*, (January 14th, 2011). Available at http://old.post-gazette.com/pg/11014/1117855-455.stm; "Mosque terror suspect has history of mental issues, crime." *Press & Guide Newspapers*, (February 1st, 2011). Available at http://www.pressandguide.com/articles/2011/02/01/news/doc4d484f255e810110855493.txt?viewmode=fullstory; Scott Shane and Eric Schmitt, "Double Agent Disrupted Bombing Plot." *New York Times*, (May 8, 2012). Available at: <a href="http://www.nytimes.com/2012/05/09/world/middleeast/suicide-mission-volunteer-was-double-agent-officials-say.html?pagewanted=all; Ryan J. Reilly, "FBI Arrests Man for Plotting to Attack Capitol, Pentagon with C-4 Loaded Remote Controlled Planes." *TPM Muckracker*, (September 28, 2011). Available at: http://tpmmuckraker.talkingpointsmemo.com/2011/09/rezwan_ferdaus_fbi_arrests_man_for_trying_to_attack_capitol_penta.php;

Appendix B: Statistical Table of Non-Muslim Domestic Terrorism Incidents Since 9/11/01

No.	Name	Date of Arrest/ Attack	Ideology	Implemented/ Prevented	Operational Stage	# of Deaths	CBRN Possession
1.	Steve Anderson	10/14/2001	White supremacist/ Christian Extremist	Implemented	Yes	0	
2.	Clayton Lee Wagner	12/5/2001	Anti-abortion	Implemented	Yes	0	
3.	Irving Rubin & Earl Krugel	10/11/2001	Anti-Government/ Jewish extremist	Prevented	No	0	
4.	Michael Edward Smith	1/4/2002	Neo-Nazi National Alliance	Prevented	Yes	0	
5.	David Burgert & Tracy Brockway	2/8/2002	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
6.	Joseph D. Konopka	3/2002	Anarchist	Prevented	Yes	0	С
7.	Charles Robert Barefoot Jr.	7/19/2002	KKK affiliated	Prevented	Yes	0	
8.	Robert J. Goldstein	8/22/2002	Jewish Extremist	Prevented	Yes	0	
9.	Larry Raugust	10/3/2002	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
10.	Andrew Mickel	11/19/2002	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	1	
11.	Matt Hale	1/8/20003	Neo-Nazi	Prevented	Yes	0	
12.	James D. Brailey	1/18/2003	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
13.	David Wayne Hull	2/13/2003	KKK	Prevented	Yes	0	
14.	David Roland Hinkson	4/3/2003	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
15.	William Krar	4/10/2003	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	С
16.	John Noster	6/4/2003	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
17.	Scott Woodring	7/7/2003	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	1	
18.	Norma Somerville	10/10/2003	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
19.	Sean Gillespie	4/1/2004	Neo-Nazi Skinhead	Prevented	Yes	0	
20.	Wade and Chris Lay	5/24/2004	Political extremists	Implemented	Yes	1	
21.	Andrew Ostanowski	9/21/2004	Neo-Nazi	Prevented	Yes	0	
22.	Ivan Duane Braden	10/13/2004	Neo-Nazi	Prevented	Yes	0	
23.	Demetrius Crocker	10/25/2004	White supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	C (attempted)
24.	Earl Flippen	12/19/2004	Aryan Brotherhood	Implemented	Yes	2	
25.	Brian Nichols	3/2005	Racial Extremist	Implemented	Yes	4	
26.	Craig Orler & Gabriel Carafa	5/20/2005	Neo-Nazi	Prevented	Yes	0	
27.	Daniel J. Schertz	6/10/2005	KKK	Prevented	Yes	0	
28.	David J. D'Addabbo	3/19/2006	Anti-tax (IRS)	Prevented	Yes	0	
29.	Liberty City 7	6/2006	"Seas of David" Cult	Prevented	Yes	0	
30.	Denys Ray Hughes	10/3/2006	Survivalist	Prevented	Yes	0	B (attempted)

32. 33. 34. 35. 36. 37.	Dillard Jason Hamilton Michael Curtis Reynolds Christopher Riendeau Dennis Clem Michael Phillips Ed and Elaine Brown Michael Alan	5/19/2007 7/13/2007 7/31/2007 8/10/2007 8/15/2007 10/5/2007	White Supremacist Anti-Government Neo-Nazi Aryan Circle White Supremacist	Implemented Prevented Prevented	Yes Yes	3 0	
34. 35. 36. 37.	Michael Curtis Reynolds Christopher Riendeau Dennis Clem Michael Phillips Ed and Elaine Brown	7/31/2007 8/10/2007 8/15/2007	Neo-Nazi Aryan Circle			0	
35. 36. 37.	Riendeau Dennis Clem Michael Phillips Ed and Elaine Brown	8/10/2007 8/15/2007	Aryan Circle	Prevented		1	
36. 37.	Michael Phillips Ed and Elaine Brown	8/15/2007			Yes	0	
37.	Phillips Ed and Elaine Brown		White Curremosist	Implemented	Yes	2	
	Brown	10/5/2007	White Supremacist	Implemented	Yes	1	
	Michael Alan		Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	0	
38.	Crooker	1/29/2008	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	B (attempted)
39.	Robert Bayliss	4/3/2008	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	0	
40.	Bradley T. Kahle, Marvin E. Hall & Perry Landis	6/8/2008	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
41.	United Cities Group	7/8/2008	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	0	
42.	Jim Adkisson	7/27/2008	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	2	
43.	Bruce E. Ivins	8/1/2008	Anti-Abortion & Christian Extremist	Implemented	Yes	5	В
44.	David Guy McKay & Bradley Neal Crowder	9/3/2008	Anarchist	Prevented	Yes	0	
45.	Daniel Cowart & Paul Schlesselman	10/24/2008	White supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	
46.	James G. Cummings	12/9/2008	Neo-Nazi	Prevented	Yes	0	R
47.	Bruce & Joshua Turnidge	12/12/2008	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	2	
48.	Kody Ray Brittingham	12/16/2008	White supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	
49.	Ronald L. Struve	1/6/2009	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
50.	Keith Luke	1/21/2009	White supremacist	Implemented	Yes	2	
51.	Harold Call	3/7/2009	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
52.	Richard Andrew Poplawski	4/4/2009	White supremacist	Implemented	Yes	3	
53.	Philip Bay	4/6/2009	White Supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	
54.	Daniel Hayden	4/11/2009	Anti-Government	Prevented	No	0	
55.	Joshua Cartwright	4/25/2009	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	2	
56.	Andrew Steven Gray	5/31/2009	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
57.	Scott Roeder	5/31/2009	Anti-abortion, Christian Extremist	Implemented	Yes	1	
58.	James von Brunn	6/10/2009	Neo-Nazi	Implemented	Yes	1	
59.	Shawn Forde	6/12/2009	Anti-immigrant	Implemented	Yes	2	
60.	Dennis Mahon and Daniel Mahon	6/25/2009	Neo-Nazi	Implemented	Yes	0	

61.	Robert Joos	6/25/2009	Neo-Nazi	Prevented	Yes	0	
62.	Glibert Ortez	7/14/2009	Neo-Nazi Sympathizer	Implemented	Yes	1	
63.	John Thomas and Burl Thomas	9/4/2009	Neo-Nazi sympathizers	Prevented	Yes	0	
64.	Mark Mentzer &	9/24/2009	White Supremacist/KKK	Prevented	Yes	0	
65.	Joshua Little Benjamin	10/9/2009	Unknown	Prevented	Yes	0	
66.	Kuzelka Christopher Monfort	11/7/2009	Unknown	Implemented	Yes	1	
67.	John Brek	10/21/2009	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
68.	Mark Campano	11/25/2009	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
69.	Warren Taylor	12/23/2009	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
70.	Charles Dyer	1/15/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
71.	Richard Cobley	1/20/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	-
72.	Gregory Girard	2/10/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	-
73.	Lowell Aughenbaugh	2/11/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
74.	Joseph A. Stack	2/18/2010	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	2	
75.	John Patrick Bedell	3/4/2010	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	0	
76.	Brody James Whitaker	3/25/2010	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	0	
77.	Norman Leboon	3/29/2010	Anti-Jewish/ Millenialist	Prevented	No	0	-
78.	Brandon Lee Hall	4/2010	White Supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	
<i>79</i> .	Mark Simmons	04/2010	White Supremacist	Implemented	Yes	1	
80.	Joseph Jeffrey Brice	04/2010	Muslim Extremist but is non-Muslim	Prevented	Yes	0	
81.	Walter Fitzpatrick	4/1/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
82.	Charles Alan Wilson	4/6/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	No	0	
83.	Gregory Lee Giusti	4/7/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	No	0	-
84.	Larry Eugene North	4/7/2010	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	0	-
85.	Matthew Fairfield	4/15/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
86.	Darren Huff	4/20/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
87.	Ross William Muehlberger	4/22/2010	White Supremacist	Implemented	Yes	1	
88.	Patrick Nugent Jr.	5/3/2010	White Supremacist	Implemented	Yes	0	
89.	Sandlin Smith	5/10/2010	Anti-Muslim	Implemented	Yes	0	<u></u>
90.	Jerry Kane and Joseph Kane	5/20/2010	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	2	
91.	Byron Williams	7/21/2010	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	0	
92.	Raymond Peake and	7/29/2010	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	1	

	Thomas Tuso						
93.	Wayde Lynn Kurt	8/30/2012	White Supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	
94.	James J. Lee	9/1/2010	Environmental Extremist	Implemented	Yes	0	
95.	Richard McLeod	9/13/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
96.	Victor Dewayne White	9/19/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
97.	James Patock	11/3/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
98.	Mark Krause	12/7/2010	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
99.	Clay Duke	12/14/2010	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	0	
100.	Justin Vieira	12/25/2010	Neo-Nazi	Prevented	Yes	0	
101.	Steven Scott Cantrell	12/28/2010	White Supremacist	Implemented	Yes	0	
102.	Jared Lee Loughner	1/8/20111/	Anti-Government	Implemented	No	6	
103.	Charles Habermann	12/2011	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
104.	Willam Harpham	1/18/2011	Neo-Nazi Sympathizer	Prevented	Yes	0	
105.	David Russell Myrland	1/25/2011	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
106.	Jeffrey Harbin	1/26/2011	Neo-Nazi	Prevented	Yes	0	
107.	Schaeffer Cox & 4 others	3/10/2011	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
108.	Donny E. Mower	3/10/2011	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
109.	John Matika	4/1/2011	Single Issue (Gun Control)	Prevented	Yes	0	
110.	Robert Olson	4/1/2011	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
111.	James Tesi	6/25/2011	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
112.	Firebombed Health Center (unknown attacker)	7/2011	Single Issue (Anti- Abortion)	Implemented	Yes	0	
113.	Glenn Neff	8/22/2011	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
114.	Joseph Gamache	8/24/2011	White Supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	
115.	Holly Grisgby & David Peterson	10/5/11	White Supremacist	Implemented	Yes	4	
116.	Frederick Thomas, Emory Dan Roberts, Ray Adams & Samuel Crump	11/2/11	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	B (attempted)
117.	Mary Morgan	11/7/11	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
118.	Oscar Ortega	11/20/11	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	0	
119.	Eli Franklin Myers	12/20/11	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	1	
120.	Shawn Rice	12/22/11	Anti-Government	Prevented	Yes	0	
121.	Ray Lazier Lengend	1/1/12	Anti-Muslim	Implemented	Yes	0	
122.	Danny Lee Warner	1/4/12	Neo-Nazi/White Supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	
123.	Francis G. Grady	01/2012	Anti-abortion	Implemented	Yes	0	

124.	Matthew	01/2012	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	1	
	David Stewart						
<i>125</i> .	Kevin Boney	2/15/2012	Anti-Government	Implemented	Yes	0	
<i>126</i> .	Brian Klose,	03/2012	White	Prevented	Yes	0	
	Ronald Cusak,		Supremacy/Aryan				
	Carlos		Nations				
	Dubose, &						
	Harold Kinlaw						
127.	Charles	03/2012	Anti-government	Prevented	Yes	0	
	Michael						
	Carlsen						
128.	Martin Kimber	04/25/2012	White Supremacy	Implemented	Yes	0	C
			Sympathizer				
129.	Samuel J.	4/27/2012	White Supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	
	Johnson &						
	Joseph						
	Benjamin						
120	Thomas	5/1/2012	TITLE OF THE STATE	D 1	¥7	0	
130.	JT Ready*	5/1/2012	White Supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	
131.	FL American	5/8/2012	White Supremacist	Prevented	Yes	0	В
	Front 12	- / - / - 0					(attempted)
132.	Brian Church,	5/16/2012	Anarchist	Prevented	Yes	0	
	Jared Chase &						
122	Brent Betterly	- ((
133.	Douglas	5/30/2012	White Supremacist,	Prevented	Yes	0	
	Howard Story		Anti-Muslim	40			
	133 Total	-	-	49	126	56	10 cases
	Incidents/			Implemented/	Operational/	deaths	
	Plots			84 Prevented	6 Aspirational		

Addendum to Appendix B: Cases Involving Members of the Nation of Islam

134.	John Allen	10/24/2002	Nation of Islam	Implemented	Yes	12	
	Muhammad and						
	Lee Malvo						
135.	Derrick Shareef	12/8/2006	Nation of Islam	Prevented	Yes	0	-
	Total (incl.						
	Nation of						
	Islam)						
	134 Total	-	-	50	128	68	10 cases
	Incidents/plots			Implemented/	Operational/	deaths	
				84 Prevented	6 Aspirational		

Note: All data entries in *italics* represent plots occurring after Barack Obama's Presidential election victory.

The "DC Snipers" and Derrick Shareef are placed as an addendum for three reasons. First, both cases were treated as terrorism cases; therefore we include it in our database. Second they are categorized as non-Muslim, because the perpetrators of both plots were members of the Nation of Islam. Unlike radical Muslim groups, according to the Wall Street Journal, the Nation of Islam is, "...an eccentric American sect that focuses on racial (black) rather than religious supremacy." The Southern Poverty Law Center also classifies the Nation of Islam as a "Black Separatist" group in its database of US domestic hate groups. Third, these cases as an addendum, rather than in the main statistical table, because there is the perception, albeit contrary to our definition of "Muslim", the Nation of Islam (NOI) is a part of orthodox Sunni and/or Shi'a Islam despite the significant theological differences. Though this report has inserted them under the non-Muslim category, its

main focus is not on theological details and therefore allows the reader to examine the data without the presence of plots from NOI militants if s/he so chooses.

Update, 4/13/2010: An alleged plot to assassinate Barack Obama during the 2008 Presidential campaign involving Shawn Adolf, Tharin Gartrell and Nathan Johnson has been removed from the database. The men were not charged with threatening Mr. Obama because, "...the men were on methamphetamine and posed no credible threat..." Source: "Shawn Adolf, Man Who Discussed Assassinating Obama, Sentenced." *Associated Press*, (March 15, 2010). Available at: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2010/03/15/shawn-adolf-man-who-discu n 499367.html.

Update, 8/23/2011: An alleged terrorism plot to assassinate elected officials, bomb bridges and tunnels, and use crude bio-chemical weapons involving Daniel and Timothy Robinson was removed from our database. All the charges relating to terrorism and murder were dropped. Source: Melanie Woodrow, "Accused Local Terrorist Cleared." *Wavy.com*, (January 27, 2011). Available at: http://www.fox43tv.com/dpps/news/local/accused-local-terrorist-cleared 3705712.

*Note on JT Ready: We include JT Ready into the Database because at the time of his murder-suicide he was under investigation by the FBI for possibly conspiring to engage in an act of domestic terrorism. However, we did not include the deaths from his murder-suicide on May 1, 2012 because the motive appeared to be based on a domestic dispute, not ideological. We also classified his plot status as "prevented" because there is currently no publicly available evidence to support the idea that he carried out any ideologically-motivated violence before his death.

Sources for the main non-Muslim statistical table: "Terror from the Right." Southern Poverty Law Center, (July 1, 2009). Available at: http://www.splcenter.org/news/item.jsp?aid=383; Brian Ross, "Bounty Hunter Disrupts Possible Terror Plots." *ABC News*, (July 31, 2007). Available at: http://blogs.abcnews.com/theblotter/2007/07/bounty-hunter-d.html; Tom Held, "Judge Calls 'Dr. Chaos' A True Danger." Milwaukee Journal Sentinel, (March 14, 2002). Available at: http://www3.jsonline.com/story/index.aspx?id=27073; William Vitka, "Penn. Man Named in Alleged Terror Plot." CBS/Associated Press, (February 11, 2006). Available at: http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2006/02/11/national/main1307690.shtml; Casey McNerthney and Chris Grygiel, "Suspect in Police Shooting 'Lone Domestic Terrorist." Seattle Post-Intelligencer, (November 7, 2009). Available at: http://www.seattlepi.com/local/411951 shooting07.html; David Neiwert, "Oath Keepers' Leader Arrested for Child Rape; Cops Find Stolen Grenade Launcher in his House." Crooks and Liars, (January 21, 2010). Available at: http://crooksandliars.com/david-neiwert/tea-party-leader-arrested-rape; Jay Root, "Plane Attack Prompts Debate Over Terrorism Label." Associated Press, (February 20, 2010). http://www.boston.com/news/nation/articles/2010/02/20/plane attack prompts debate over terrorism label/?r ss id=Boston.com+--+Latest+news; "Rash of Bomb Cases Tied to Radical-Right Views." Southern Poverty Law Center, (Spring 2010). Available at: http://www.splcenter.org/get-informed/intelligence-report/browse-allissues/2010/spring/rash-of-bomb-cases-tied-to-radical-ri; Michael Sangiacomo, "Law Enforcement Investigating Man Injured Making Pipe Bombs." Cleveland.com (November 25, 2009). Available at: http://blog.cleveland.com/metro/2009/11/law enforcement investigating.html; "White Supremacist from Area Arrested." The Joplin Globe, (June 25, 2009). Available at: http://www.joplinglobe.com/neosho newton mcdonald%20county/local story 176221119.html/resources prin tstory; KC Kotyk, "Aughenbaugh Arrested After 12-Hour Standoff." Rolla Daily News, (February 12, 2010). Available at: http://www.therolladailynews.com/news/x626054180/Aughenbaugh-arrested-after-12-hourstandoff: "Trenton Man Charged with Illegally Possessing Firearms, Homemade Bombs," Department of Justice, (January 21, 2010). http://www.justice.gov/usao/mow/news2010/cobley.com.htm; Jonathan Phelps and Julie Manganis, "Ready for 'Armaggedon." Gloucester Daily Times, (February 10, 2010). Available at: http://www.gloucestertimes.com/punews/local story 041222314.html; Olsen Ebright and Jonathan Lloyd, "Bomb Parts, Marijuana, Day Care Center Do Not Mix." NBC Los Angeles, (October 12, 2009). Available at:

```
http://www.nbclosangeles.com/news/local-beat/Lake-Elsinore-Pipe-Bomb-Arrest-63782027.html; Crissy
Clutter, "Students Arrested for Alleged Bomb Plot." CBS News WTRF 7, (September 25, 2009). Available at:
http://wtrf.com/story.cfm?func=viewstory&storyid=67231; Ruth Fuller, "Antioch Man Arrested in Wis; Faces
More Charges." ChicagoBreakingNews.com, (September 4, 2009). Available at:
http://www.chicagobreakingnews.com/2009/09/antioch-lake-county-states-attorney-john-thomas-burl-weapons-
explosives-nazi-paraphernelia.html; "Weapons Arsenal Found in Washington Storage Units." Anti-Defamation
League, (January 28, 2009). Available at:
http://www.adl.org/learn/extremism in the news/Anti Government/struve+wa.htm?LEARN Cat=Extremism
&LEARN SubCat=Extremism in the News; Mary Pat Flaherty, Hamil R. Harris, and Michael E. Ruane,
"Pentagon Gunman 'Had Gone Off the Deep End,' According to Friends, Writings." Washington Post, (March
5, 2010). Available at: http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-
dyn/content/article/2010/03/05/AR2010030500957 pf.html; Kathy Adams and Shawn Day, "Teen Accused in
Landstown Bomb Plot 'Hard to Miss.'" Virginian-Pilot, (July 19, 2009). Available at:
http://hamptonroads.com/2009/07/teen-accused-landstown-bomb-plot-hard-miss; Carrie Johnson, "9 Members
of Militia Group Charged in Plot Against U.S." Washington Post, (March 30, 2010). Available at:
http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dvn/content/article/2010/03/29/AR2010032901541.html; Jake Sherman,
"Man Arrested for Eric Cantor Death Threat." Politico, (March 29, 2010). Available at:
http://www.politico.com/news/stories/0310/35152.html; Schuyler Dixon, "Feds: Texas Pipe Bomb Suspect
Angry at Gov't." Associated Press, (April 8, 2010). Available at:
http://www.talkingpointsmemo.com/news/2010/04/feds texas pipe bomb suspect angry at govt.php; Jason
Dearden, "FBI Arrests Calif Man for Alleged Pelosi Threats." Associated Press, (April 7, 2010). Available at:
http://www.publicopiniononline.com/news/ci 14842945; Andrew Ramonas, "Man Referenced Holder's
'Nation of Cowards' Remark in Threat to Senator." Main Justice, (April 6, 2010). Available at:
http://www.mainjustice.com/2010/04/06/man-charged-with-threatening-senator-referenced-holder/; Marissa
Millender, "Suspect Had Faced Felony Charges in Four Pending Cases." Times Record News, (April 22, 2010),
Available at: http://www.timesrecordnews.com/news/2010/apr/22/suspect-had-faced-felony-charges-in-4-
pending/; David Kelly, "Members of Gang Task Force in Hemet are Target by a Booby Trap for the Second
Time." Los Angeles Times, (February 25, 2010). Available at:
http://latimesblogs.latimes.com/lanow/2010/02/calling-it-an-act-of-domestic-terrorism-hemet-police-are-on-
high-alert-after-a-booby-trap-targeting-members-of-the-gang-task.html; Robert J. Lopez and Andrew
Blankenstein, "White Supremacist Group Tied to Attacks Against Hemet Police." Los Angeles Times, (April 20,
2010). Available at: http://latimesblogs.latimes.com/lanow/2010/04/-hemet-.html; John Asbury, "Charges Filed
Against Suspected White Supremacist in Hemet Raid." The Press-Enterprise, (May 3, 2010). Available at:
http://www.pe.com/localnews/stories/PE News Local W eraid03.4933b42.html. Larry Hannan, "Police Ask
Jacksonville Community to Help Catch Mosque Bomber." Florida Times-Union, (May 12, 2010). Available at:
http://jacksonville.com/news/crime/2010-05-12/story/pipe-bomb-used-jacksonville-mosque-blast; "FBI
Shootout Kills Wanted Mosque Bombing Suspect." Associated Press. (May 6, 2011), Available at:
http://policelink.monster.com/news/articles/153978-fbi-shootout-kills-wanted-mosque-bombing-
suspect?print=true; "Claims Police Shooting Suspects Had Extremist 'Anti-Government' Links." CNN, (May
22, 2010). Available at: http://edition.cnn.com/2010/CRIME/05/22/arkansas.police.shot/; Jamal Thalji, "Father,
Son in Arkansas Cop Killings Were Headed Home to Clearwater." St. Petersburg Times, (May 22, 2010).
Available at: http://www.tampabay.com/news/publicsafety/crime/father-son-in-arkansas-cop-killings-were-
headed-home-to-clearwater/1097053; Zachary Roth, "Right-Wing Extremist Take on Local Law Enforcement;
Lose." Talking Points Memo, (May 6, 2010). Available at:
http://tpmmuckraker.talkingpointsmemo.com/2010/05/right-
wing extremists take on local law enforcemen.php; Mike Gangloff, "Wytheville's Anti-Government
Hostage-Taker Pleads Guilty." Roanoke Times. (May 14, 2010). Available at:
http://www.roanoke.com/news/breaking/wb/246836; "Georgia Man Accused of Traveling to Tennessee for
Armed Takeover of Courthouse." WBIR.com, (May 4, 2010). Available at:
http://www.wbir.com/news/local/story.aspx?storyid=120662&catid=2; Mark Puente, "Man Charged with
Having Explosives Seemed Paranoid, Landlord Says." Cleveland Plain Dealer, (April 20, 2010). Available at:
```

```
http://blog.cleveland.com/metro/2010/04/man charged with having explos.html; Cindy Horswell, "Sheriff:
Explosives at Home of Deputy's Killer." Houston Chronicle, (July 14, 2009). Available at:
http://www.chron.com/disp/story.mpl/breaking/6527756.html; Erica Moffitt, Ben Russell, and Ewa Roman,
"Guards Charged in Shooting Suspended." CBS 21, (August 3, 2010), Available at:
http://www.whptv.com/news/local/story/UPDATE-Guards-charged-in-shooting-suspended/T7TvwdSx-
0efWskrT3nupg.cspx; "Highway Shooter Targeted Tides Foundation, ACLU." KTVU.com, (July 21, 2010),
Available at: http://www.ktvu.com/news/24327003/detail.html; Andrew Schenkel, "Discovery Channel
Standoff Puts Spotlight on Environmental Extremism." Mother Nature Network. (September 6, 2010).
Available: http://www.miamiherald.com/2010/09/06/1810585/discovery-channel-standoff-puts.html; Dean
Schabner, "Sorting out Simple Hate from Terrorism." ABC News, (September 21, 2004). Available at:
http://abcnews.go.com/US/story?id=96671&page=1; Helen Jung, "Bruce and Joshua Turnidge Get Death
Penalty in Woodburn Bank Bombing." The Oregonian, (December 22, 2010). Available at:
http://www.oregonlive.com/pacific-northwest-news/index.ssf/2010/12/post 7.html; Ryan J. Reilly, "Attempted
Pepsi Can Bomber, Worried by Gov't, Tracked Down Via Facebook." TPMMuckraker, (December 7, 2010).
Available at:
http://tpmmuckraker.talkingpointsmemo.com/2010/12/attempted pepsi can bomber worried by govt tracked
 down via facebook video.php?ref=fpa; "School Board Shooting: Clay Duke Kills Self After Pulling at
Meeting." Associated Press, (December 15, 2010). Available at: http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-
dyn/content/article/2010/12/15/AR2010121500632.html; John Moss, "Police: Bogle Street Man Waves Nazi
Flag, Threatens to Cut Gas Line During Hours Long Standoff." Herald News, (December 25, 2010). Available
at: http://www.wickedlocal.com/fall-river/news/x1651495404/Police-Bogle-Street-man-waves-Nazi-flag-
threatens-to-cut-gas-line-during-hourslong-standoff; "U.S. v. Batiste, et al." Department of Justice, (June 22,
2006). Available at: http://news.findlaw.com/hdocs/docs/terrorism/usbatiste62206ind4.html; Bennie Thompson,
"Homegrown Terrorists Are Not Just Muslims. Politico, (January 27, 2011), Available at:
http://www.politico.com/news/stories/0111/48239.html; Husna Haq, "Jared Lee Loughner: Seeking Insight
from his Reading List." Christian Science Monitor, (January 10, 2011). Available at:
http://www.csmonitor.com/Books/chapter-and-verse/2011/0110/Jared-Lee-Loughner-seeking-insight-from-his-
reading-list; "Poll: Anti-Government Violence? Some Say Yes." Seattle Post-Intelligencer, (January 11, 2011).
Available at: http://blog.seattlepi.com/seattlepolitics/archives/235321.asp; Janet Novack, "Expert: Loughner
Rants Sound Like Sovereign Citizen Beliefs." Forbes Magazine, (January 12, 2011). Available at:
http://blogs.forbes.com/janetnovack/2011/01/12/expert-loughner-rants-sound-like-sovereign-citizen-
beliefs/?boxes=Homepagechannels; "FBI: Bomb Found on MLK March Route." MSNBC, (January 18, 2011).
Available at: http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/41139894/ns/us news-crime and courts/; Mike Carter, Steve
Miletich, and Jennifer Sullivan, "Man Charged with Attempted MLK Day Bombing Linked to Neo-Nazi
Group." Seattle Times, (March 9, 2011), Available at:
http://seattletimes.nwsource.com/html/localnews/2014443763 spokanebomb10m.html; "Arrest Made in MLK
Parade Bomb Plot." MSNBC, (March 9, 2011). Available at:
http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/41991581/ns/us news-crime and courts/; Samantha Szesciorka, "Police:
California Man Threatened Detroit Area Mosque." KTVN News, (January 31, 2011). Available at:
http://www.ktvn.com/Global/story.asp?S=13943293; "Texas Man Sentenced on Firearms Charges Connected to
the Republican National Convention." Federal Bureau of Investigation, (May 21, 2009), Available at:
http://minneapolis.fbi.gov/dojpressrel/pressrel09/mp052109a.htm; James Walsh, "Second Texan Gets Four
Years in RNC Plot." Minneapolis Star Tribune, (May 21, 2009). Available at:
http://www.startribune.com/politics/national/conventions/45694662.html; James C. McKinley Jr., "Anarchist
Ties Seen in '08 Bombings of Texas Governor's Mansion." New York Times, (February 22, 2011). Available at:
http://www.nytimes.com/2011/02/23/us/23texas.html?src=twrhp; Marc Bluestein, "Letters: Courthouse
Gunman Angry at Justice System." Associated Press. (March 27, 2011). Available at:
http://www.forbes.com/feeds/ap/2011/03/27/general-us-atlanta-courthouse-gunman 8377162.html; Sam
Friedman, "Five Arrested in Alleged Plot to Kidnap, Kill Alaska State Troopers, Judge." Fairbanks Daily
News-Miner, (March 10, 2011). Available at: http://newsminer.com/view/full_story/12286233/article-Law-
enforcement-agencies-move-against-Sovereign-Citizen-movement-in-Fairbanks; Patti Epler, "More Details
```

```
Emerge in Fairbanks Militia Arrests." Alaska Dispatch, (March 26, 2011). Available at:
http://www.alaskadispatch.com/article/more-details-emerge-fairbanks-militia-arrests: Jim Guy, "Bus Driver
Charged in Attack on Madera Planned Parenthood." Fresno Bee, (March 10, 2011). Available at:
http://www.fresnobee.com/2011/03/10/2304094/arrest-made-in-islamic-center.html; Scott Shane and Eric
Lichtblau, "Scientist's Suicide Linked to Anthrax Inquiry." New York Times, (August 2, 2008). Available at:
http://www.nytimes.com/2008/08/02/washington/02anthrax.html. Thomas F. Dellafera, "Application and
Affidavit for Search Warrant Case Number: 07-524-M-01." U.S. District Court of the District of Columbia,
(October 31, 2007). Available at: http://www.fbi.gov/about-us/history/famous-cases/anthrax-amerithrax/07-
524-M-01%20Search%20Warrant%20Affidavit.pdf, P. 18-19; "White Supremacist Brandon Lee Hall
Sentenced to 30 Years in Prison." GADailynews.com, (April 7, 2011). Available at:
http://www.allmetronews.com/local/65065-white-supremacist-brandon-lee-hall-sentenced-to-30-years-in-
prison.html; Larry Hartstein, "White Supremacist Sentenced to 30 Years." Atlanta Constitution-Journal, (April
8, 2011). Available at: http://www.ajc.com/news/atlanta/white-supremacist-sentenced-to-903011.html. David
Owens and Jenna Carlesso, "State Police: Man Accused of Shooting at Florida Troopers has been Found."
Hartford Courant, (April 7, 2010). Available at: http://articles.courant.com/2010-04-07/business/hc-manhunt-
winsted-0406 1 troopers-state-police-bail; Christina Boomber, "Officials: Safety Mechanisms in Place as Mesa
Worker Disrupts Wastewater Facility." ABC 15, (April 1, 2011). Available at:
http://www.abc15.com/dpp/news/region southeast valley/gilbert/officials%3A-safety-mechanisms-in-place-as-
mesa-worker-disrupts-wastewater-facility; Lisa Leigh Kelly, "Wastewater Worker Charged with Terrorism."
KPFO CBS 5, (April 4, 2011). Available at: http://www.kpho.com/valleynews/27403898/detail.html; "The
Lawless Ones: The Resurgence of the Sovereign Citizen Movement." Anti-Defamation League, (August 11,
2010). Available at: http://www.adl.org/learn/sovereign movement/list recent sovereign incidents.pdf; VM-
Mctor Manuel Ramos, "United Cities Leaders Taken on Bank of America in Dispute over $15B." Orlando
Sentinel, (July 29, 2008). Available at: http://articles.orlandosentinel.com/2008-07-29/news/CRUZ29 1 bank-
of-america-bank-officer-miami-branch; Casey Sanchez, "Return of the Sovereigns." Intelligence Report, No.
133, (Spring 2009). Available at: http://www.splcenter.org/get-informed/intelligence-report/browse-all-
issues/2009/spring/return-of-the-sovereigns; Jeff German, "Gun Charge Sends Man to Prison." Las Vegas
Review-Journal, (August 24, 2010). Available at: http://www.lvrj.com/news/las-vegas-man-sentenced-to-
prison-in-federal-gun-case-101414779.html; "Members of Anti-Government Group Arrested in Las Vegas."
Associated Press, (March 7, 2009). Available at: http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,506746,00.html;
"Marshals Posed as Fans to Arrest Tax Evaders." Associated Press, (October 5, 2007). Available at:
http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/21142564/; Deb Feyerick and Eden Pontz, "Feds Tricked Holed-Up Tax
Evaders." CNN, (October 5, 2007). Available at: http://articles.cnn.com/2007-10-05/us/tax.standoff 1 marshal-
stephen-monier-evaders-browns? s=PM:US; "UPDATE: Richland County Standoff." Associated Press, (April
3, 2009). Available at: http://www.nbc15.com/home/headlines/17265899.html; Levi Pulkkinen, "Alleged
Secessionist Charged with Gun, Drug Charges." Seattle Post-Intelligencer, (May 31, 2009). Available at:
http://www.seattlepi.com/default/article/Alleged-secessionist-charged-with-gun-drug-1304237.php: Casev
Sanchez, "Allege Sovereign Citizen Arrested on Weapons and Drug Charges." Hatewatch, (June 2, 2009).
Available at: http://www.splcenter.org/blog/2009/06/02/alleged-sovereign-citizen-arrested-on-weapons-and-
drug-charges/; Levi Booth, "Murder, Incorporated?" The Washington Post, (April 4, 2005). Available at:
http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dvn/articles/A24016-2005Apr3.html; "Fugitive Michigan Militia Member
Dies in Shootout." Anti-Defamation League, (July 16, 2003). Available at:
http://www.adl.org/learn/news/Officer Killed michigan.asp; "White Supremacist Kills Pregnant Woman and
Officer in Arizona." Anti-Defamation League, (January 6, 2005). Available at:
http://www.adl.org/learn/extremism in the news/White Supremacy/ws Flippen 2005.htm; Taryrn Brodwater,
Bill Morlin, and Amy Cannata, "Shooter Had Aryan Nation Ties." Spokesman Review, (May 23, 2007).
Available at: http://www.spokesmanreview.com/breaking/story.asp?ID=9985; "Louisiana Cop Killer Wore
Nazi, Confederate Flag Emblems, Jewelry." Fox News, (December 31, 2007). Available at:
http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,319185,00.html; Michael Wells, "Fla. Sheriff's Deputy Fatally Shot in
Cruiser." Police One, (August 15, 2007). Available at: http://www.policeone.com/officer-
shootings/articles/1341150-Fla-sheriffs-deputy-fatally-shot-in-cruiser/; Duncan Mansfield, "Jim D. Adkisson
```

```
Charged in Tennessee Church Shooting that Killed 2." Huffington Post, (July 28, 2008). Available at:
http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2008/07/28/jim-d-adkisson-charged-in n 115281.html; "Tea Party Twitter
Arrest: Daniel Hayden Threatened Mass Murder, Cop Killing." Huffington Post, (April 26, 2009). Available at:
http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2009/04/26/tea-party-twitter-arrest n 191527.html; "Newark security guard
John Brek arraigned on 3 charges for threats against President Obama." New Jersey Newsroom, (October 22,
2009). Available at: http://www.newiersevnewsroom.com/nation/newark-security-guard-john-brek-arraigned-
on-3-charges-for-threats-against-president-obama; Lauren Zakalik, "Sheriff: Man Arrested for Gun, Has Militia
Ties." WILX, (September 14, 2010). Available at: http://www.wilx.com/news/headlines/102906814.html;
"Arizona Man Found with Guns at National Mall." Fox DC, (November 4, 2010). Available at:
http://www.myfoxdc.com/dpps/news/crime watch/arizona-man-found-guns-natl-mall-apx-
11042010 10464000; Sean Alfano, "Charles Habermann arrested for allegedly threatening to kill Rep. Jim
McDermott in voicemails." New York Daily News, (January 13, 2011). Available at:
http://articles.nydailynews.com/2011-01-13/news/27087381 1 federal-charges-mcdermottt-complaint; Evelyn
Schlatter, "Neo-Nazi Indicted for Bombs is Son of Movement Stalwart." Southern Poverty Law Center, (January
28, 2011). Available at: http://www.splcenter.org/blog/2011/01/28/neo-nazi-indicted-for-bombs-is-son-of-
movement-stalwart/; "Member of Arvan Brotherhood Pleads Guilty to Hate Crime in Connection with Church
Arson and Attempted Murder of Disabled African-American in Texas." U.S. Department of Justice, (September
2, 2011). Available at: http://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/2011/September/11-crm-1131.html; "FBI Investigating"
Firebombing at Women's Center." WDIV-DT NBC 4, (August 3, 2011). Available at:
http://www.clickondetroit.com/news/28751889/detail.html; Justin Jouvenal, "Police: Man Planned Fireworks
Protest on Mall." Washington Post, (August 22, 2011). Available at:
http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/crime-scene/post/police-man-planned-fireworks-protest-on-
mall/2011/08/23/gIQAYghQYJ blog.html; Chad Garrison, "Racist Goes Beserk with at South-County Mall –
Attacks Group with Pickaxe." Riverfront Times, (August 25, 2011). Available at:
http://blogs.riverfronttimes.com/dailyrft/2011/08/joseph gamache racist attack mall.php; Kim Murphy, "Man
Accused of Firebombing Mosque Talked of Christian Jihad." Los Angeles Times, (August 26, 2011). Available
at: http://www.sacbee.com/2011/08/26/3864391/man-accused-of-firebombing-mosque.html: Ashley Gebb.
"Supremacist Defends Couple's Slayings." Appeal-Democrat, (October 14, 2011). Available at:
http://www.appeal-democrat.com/news/grigsby-110615-killing-good.html; Bill Rankin, Christian Boone, and
Katie Leslie, "Georgia Militia Plot: Affidavit Outlines Plans for Killings." Atlanta Constitution Journal,
(November 2, 2011). Available at: http://www.ajc.com/news/atlanta/georgia-militia-plot-affidavit-
1214918.html; Jillian Rayfield, "AK Sovereign Citizen Had Bomb-Making Instructions, Info on 'Remote
Viewing." Talking Points Memo, (November 7, 2011). Available at:
http://tpmmuckraker.talkingpointsmemo.com/2011/11/ak sovereign citizen had bomb-
making instructions.php; Willam Yardley, "White House Shooting Suspect's Path to Extremism." New York
Times, (November 20, 2011). Available at: http://www.nytimes.com/2011/11/21/us/oscar-ortega-white-house-
shooting-suspect-struggled-with-mental-illness.html? r=1: "(U) Domestic Terrorists' Intent and Capability to
Use Chemical, Biological, Radiological, and Nuclear Weapons." Federal Bureau of Investigation/Department
of Homeland Security, (October 14, 2008). Available at: http://info.publicintelligence.net/FBIdomesticcbrn.pdf;
"Special Report on Ricin." James Martin Center for Nonproliferation Studies, (February 29, 2008). Available
at: http://cns.miis.edu/stories/pdfs/080229 ricin.pdf; Denys Ray Hughes, "Survivalist Man Convicted of
Attempting to Make Ricin on the Run." WSAW.com, (June 18, 2011). Available at:
http://www.wsaw.com/home/headlines/Surivalist Man Convicted of Attempting to Make Ricin on the Ru
n 124137064.html; Paul Peirce, "Washington County Officer Stopped After Making Routine Traffic Stop."
Pittsburgh Tribune-Review, (December 20, 2011). Available at:
http://www.pittsburghlive.com/x/valleynewsdispatch/s 772706.html; Angela Piazza, "FBI Seizes Seligman
man After Standoff." Arizona Republic News. (December 22, 2011). Available at:
http://tucsoncitizen.com/arizona-news/2011/12/22/fbi-seizes-seligman-man-after-standoff/; Thomas Zambito,
"Mosque Firebomber Faces Life in Prison for Hate Crimes." New York Daily News, (January 5, 2012).
Available at: http://www.nydailynews.com/news/crime/mosque-firebomber-faces-life-prison-hate-crimes-
article-1,1001595; Rocco Parascandola, Matt McNulty, Kerry Burke, and Kevin Deutch, "Alleged Queens
```

Firebomber Wanted to Massacre Muslims in Mosque, Prosecutors Say." New York Daily News, (January 5, 2012). Available at: http://www.nydailynews.com/new-vork/alleged-gueens-firebomber-wanted-massacremuslims-mosque-prosecutors-article-1.1001193?localLinksEnabled=false; "FBI Arrests Fugitive in Havasu." Today's News Herald, (December 30, 2011). Available at: http://www.havasunews.com/articles/2011/12/30/news/doc4efd3d53253af976704479.txt; "FBI Warns of White Supremacist Threat Against ADL's Foxman." Jewish Telegraphic Agency, (January 4, 2012), Available at: http://www.thejewishweek.com/news/breaking news/fbi warns white supremacist threat against adls foxma n; "Texas Jury Hears Account of Fatal Shooting by White Supremacist." Southern Poverty Law Center, (April 5th, 2012). Available at http://www.splcenter.org/blog/2012/04/05/texas-jury-hears-account-of-fatal-shootingby-white-supremacist/; "Accused Utah Cop-Killer had Antigovernment Views." Southern Poverty Law Center, (April 5th, 2012). Available at http://www.splcenter.org/blog/2012/04/05/accused-utah-cop-killer-hadantigovernment-views/; "Feds Charge Ex-Con in Wisconsin Abortion Clinic Bombing." Southern Poverty Law Center, (April 4th, 2012). Available at http://www.splcenter.org/blog/2012/04/04/feds-charge-ex-con-inwisconsin-abortion-clinic-bombing/; "Authorities searching dead hoarder's apartment for explosives." KHOU-TV, Inc, (March 30th, 2012). Available at http://www.khou.com/news/local/Apartment-complex-evacuatedafter-reports-of-explosives-145199575.html; "Racist Bikers Busted in Undercover Florida Probe." Southern Poverty Law Center, (March 30th, 2012). Available at http://www.splcenter.org/blog/2012/03/30/racist-bikersbusted-in-undercover-florida-probe/; "The Jihadist Who Wasn't." IntelWire, (June 24th, 2011). Available at http://news.intelwire.com/2011/06/jihadist-who-wasnt.html; Bill Morlin, "FBI: Washington White Supremacist Plotted to Kill Obama in 2010." Southern Poverty Law Center, (May 10, 2012). Available at: http://www.splcenter.org/blog/2012/05/10/fbi-washington-white-supremacist-plotted-to-kill-obama-in-2010/; Jim Mustian, "Standoff Comes to Peaceful End." OA.com, (September 19, 2010). Available at: http://www.oaoa.com/articles/sheriff-53065-authorities-shot.html; Bill Morlin, "'Sovereign Citizen' Sentenced for 'Deadly Force' Threats." Southern Poverty Law Center, (December 5, 2011). Available at: http://www.splcenter.org/blog/2011/12/05/sovereign-citizen-sentenced-for-deadly-force-threats/; Nina Golgowski, "Connecticut Man Allegedly Threatens Legislator over Ammo Bill." CNN, (April 1, 2011). Available at: http://articles.cnn.com/2011-04-01/justice/connecticut.legislator.threat 1 giffords-shootingtucson-supermarket-john-matika? s=PM:CRIME; Linda M. Gentile, "Statement of State Representative Linda Gentile on Arrest of Local Man on Harassment Charges." Office of Connecticut State Representative Linda Gentile, (April 1, 2011). Available at: http://www.housedems.ct.gov/gentile/2011/pr104 2011-04-01.html; Domingo Ramirez Jr., "Man in 'Sovereign Group' is Wounded in Shootout." Star-Telegram, (July 22, 2011). Available at: http://www.star-telegram.com/2011/07/21/3238352/man-in-sovereign-citizen-group.html; Mike Glenn, "After Hourlong Standoff, Armed Liberty Man Surrenders." Houston Chronicle, (February 15, 2012). Available at: http://www.chron.com/default/article/After-hourlong-standoff-armed-Liberty-County-man-3327907.php; Richard S. Hartunian, "Man Indicted for Chemical Weapons Offenses." U.S. Attorney's Office of the Northern District of New York, (May 17, 2012). Available at: http://www.fbi.gov/albany/pressreleases/2012/man-indicted-for-chemical-weapons-offenses: Kay Fate, "Feds Charge Area Man With Weapons Violations." *Rochester Post-Bulletin*, (April 28, 2012). Available at: http://www.postbulletin.com/news/stories/display.php?id=1494803; Nick R. Martin, "Neo-Nazi JT Ready Was Target of FBI Domestic Terrorism Investigation at Time of Massacre." TPM Muckracker, (May 4, 2012). Available at: http://tpmmuckraker.talkingpointsmemo.com/2012/05/fbi it ready domestic terrorism.php; Richard Fausset, "White Supremacist Arrested on 'Race War' Charges in Florida." Los Angeles Times, (May 8, 2012). Available at: http://www.latimes.com/news/nation/nationnow/la-na-nn-alleged-nazi-plot-florida-20120508,0,7506658.story; "State of Florida vs. Marcus Faella." Florida State 9th Circuit Judicial Court, (May 3, 2012). Available at: http://www.floridatoday.com/assets/pdf/A918903359.PDF; "The Charges Against the 'NATO 3'." Chicago Sun-Times, (May 16, 2012). Available at: http://www.suntimes.com/12639600-761/thecharges-against-the-nato-3.html; Frank Main, Mark Konkol, and Michael Landsu, "'NATO 3' Plotted Attacks on Obama HQ, Rahm's House, Police Stations, Prosecutors Say." Chicago Sun-Times, (May 19, 2012). Available at: http://www.suntimes.com/12635179-761/nato-3-plotted-attacks-on-obama-election-hg-rahmshouse-police-stations-prosecutors-say.html; Erin Gibson, "Accused White Supremacist Bought Illegal

Weapon." *Manassas Patch*, (May 30, 2012). Available at: http://manassas.patch.com/articles/accused-white-supremacists-bought-illegal-weapon.

<u>Sources specifically for the Nation of Islam cases</u>: "Sniper Reportedly Details 4 New Shootings." *Associated Press*, (June 16, 2006). Available at: http://www.kxnet.com/getARticle.asp?setCity=bis&ArticleId=13796; Tina Stein, "Neighborhood Reaction." *CBS 23 WIFR*, (December 8, 2006). Available at:

http://www.wifr.com/home/headlines/4871531.html; James Taranto, "The Motive Remains Murky." (November 11, 2009). Available at:

http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704402404574529513061187736.html?mod=djemEditorialPage; "Active U.S. Hate Groups in 2008: Black Separatist." *Southern Poverty Law Center*, (N.D.), http://www.splcenter.org/intel/map/type.jsp?DT=3.

Appendix C: Dates of Radicalization for Muslim Violent Extremists Since Obama's Election

	Name of Suspect	Date of Arrest/Attack	Approximate Date of Radicalization	Source
1.	Bryant Neal Vinas	11/2008	Since at least "Summer of 2007"	<u>CNN</u>
2.	"Newburgh Four"	5/20/2009	Since at least June 2008	New York Times
3.	Abdulhakim Mujahid Muhammad	6/1/2009	November 2008	New York Times
4.	"North Carolina 7"	7/27/2009	Since at least March 2006	Department of Justice Criminal Complaint
5.	Michael Finton	9/16/2009	At least 2007	New York Times
6.	Hosam Smadi	9/17/2009	At least 2007	Dallas Morning News
7.	Najibullah Zazi	9/19/2009	At least August 2008	Associated Press
8.	Colleen LaRose	10/2009	Since at least 2007	Wall Street Journal
9.	Tarek Mehanna	10/21/2009	Since at least 2004	Boston Globe
10.	Nidal Hasan	11/6/2009	Since at least 2007	Washington Post
11.	"Virginia 5"	12/10/09	At least August 2009	BBC
12.	Faisal Shahzad	4/30/2010	2007	New York Times
13.	Mohamed Mahmood Alessa & Carlos Eduardo Almonte	6/6/2010	Sometime between 2004- 2007	<u>CNN</u>
14.	Zachary Chesser	7/21/2010	At least June 2008	Fox News and Department of Justice Affidavit
15.	Paul Rockwood	7/21/2010	Sometime between 2001- 2006	Department of Justice Press Release
16.	Shaker Masri	8/3/2010	Unknown	
17.	Abdel Hameed Shehadeh	10/27/2010	June 2008	Department of Justice Criminal Complaint
18.	Farooque Ahmed	10/28/2010	Unknown	
19.	Mohamed Osman Mohamud	11/26/2010	Since at least 2006	<u>Department of Justice</u> Affidavit
20.	Antonio Martinez	12/8/2010	At least December 2008	Associated Press
21.	Emerson Begolly	01/04/2011	Since at least 2003	Southern Poverty Law Center
22.	Roger Stockham	01/24/2011	At least since 2002	Press & Guide
23.	Waad Alwan	5/30/2011	At least 2005	Department of Justice Affidavit
24.	Abu Khalid Abdul-Latif & Walli Mujahidh	6/23/2011	At least 2007	Seattle Post- Intelligencer & Seattle Times
25.	Ulugbek Kodirov	07/2011	At least 2009	Sky News
26.	Naser Jason Abdo	7/28/2011	At least June 2010	New York Times
27.	Mansour Arbabsiar	09/2011	Unknown	
28.	Rezwan Ferdaus	9/28/2011	At least early 2010	<u>Department of Justice</u> Affidavit
28.	Jose Pimentel	11/21/2011	At least March 2009	Wall Street Journal
29.	Craig Baxam	12/2011	Since at least July 2011	NY Daily News
30.	Sami Osmakac	1/7/2012	At least November 2010	Associated Press
31.	Amine El-Khalifi	2/27/2012	At least mid-2010	Fox News

<u>Summary of Findings</u>: The baseline measurement used for measuring a "recent trend" in ideological extremism is Obama's 2008 election. Based on our findings, 19 out of 31 post-Obama election plots (61%) involving "Muslim Americans" (defined as a U.S. citizen, legal permanent resident, or long-term resident [living in the United States for 5 years or more]), were done by people radicalized before Obama's election. 2 cases (6%) remain unknown. 10 out of 31 cases (32%), are individuals involved in extremist activities after Obama's election.

A plot is counted as a post-Obama radicalization case if reliable sources indicate that at least one person in a violent extremist plot (even if there are multiple people involved that plot) is radicalized after the Presidential election of Barack Obama.

Taken at face value, our overall findings tend to suggest that while there has been a recent spike of individuals crossing over the legal threshold from legally-protected activity into violent criminal behavior, it does not indicate a rise in "radicalization" – i.e. the rise in extremist, but legally-protected political thought and behavior.

Yet, it is important to note that information available on the last seven cases in our dataset all involve individuals who were radicalized after Obama's election. This particular finding probably due to at least two factors. First, and as a cautionary note for the entire database, these figures are largely derived from secondary open source information. As a result that raises issues of access to information that could potentially inflate numbers suggesting higher numbers of "recently" radicalized individuals, when the opposite could be the case. Second, given the time lapsed between Obama's election and this latest update (June 2012), arguably the utility of using the 2008 election as a baseline measurement is diminishing. That is to say, that as time goes on with updating the database, the last Presidential election continues to be come less "recent".

Appendix D: Terror Plots Possibly Influenced by Anwar Al-Awlaki

The following terror plots listed below are taken from MPAC's Post-9/11 Terrorism Incident Database and analyzed further to see what possible influence, if any, Anwar Al-Awlaki had on other Al-Qaeda related violent extremists. The categories of influence are unknown, Inspirational, and Operational. **Inspirational** can include ideological reinforcement of extremism through reading and audiovisual material. **Operational** involves direct logistical and tactical planning to commit an act of violence.

<u>#</u>	<u>Terrorist Plot</u>	Type of Influence	<u>Source</u>
1.	Bryant Neal Vinas	Unknown	
2.	Newburgh four	Unknown	
3.	Abdulhakim Mujahid Muhammad	Inspirational	Knoxville Commercial Appeal
4.	North Carolina 7	Unknown	
5.	Michael Finton	Inspirational	NEFA Foundation
6.	Hosam Smadi	Unknown	
7.	Najibullah Zazi	Unknown	
8.	Colleen LaRose	Inspirational	MSNBC
9.	Tarek Mehanna	Inspirational	US News & World Report
10.	Nidal Hasan	Inspirational	ABC News
11.	Virginia 5	Unknown	
12.	Umar Farouk Abdulmuttallab	Inspirational and Possibly Operational	<u>CBS News</u>
13.	Faisal Shazad	Inspirational	Christian Science Monitor
14.	Mohamed Mahmoud Alessa & Carlos Eduardo Almonte	Inspirational	<u>CNN</u>
15.	Zachary Chesser	Inspirational	Christian Science Monitor
16.	Paul G. Rockwood	Inspirational	<u>CNN</u>
17.	Shaker Masri	Inspirational	Associated Press
18.	Abdel Hameed Shehadeh	Inspirational	Los Angeles Times

19.	Farooque Ahmed	Inspirational	<u>CNN</u>
20.	"Cargo Bomb Plot" (Ibrahim Hassan Al-Asiri)	Operational	CBS
21.	Rezwan Ferdaus	Unknown	
22.	Mohamed Osman	Inspirational	<u>CNN</u>
23.	Antonio Martinez	Inspirational	Baltimore Sun
24.	Khalid Al-Dawsari	Unknown	
25.	Waad Alwan	Unknown	
26.	Abu Khalid Abdul-Latif & Walli Mujahidh	Unknown	<u>MSNBC</u>
27.	Naser Jason Abdo	Inspirational	ABC News
28.	Jose Pimentel	Inspirational	New York Times
29.	Sami Osmakac	Unknown	
30.	Craig Baxam	Unknown	
31.	Ulugbek Kodirov	Unknown	
32.	Emerson Begolly	Unknown	
33.	Roger Stockham	Unknown	
34.	Mansour Arbabsiar	Unknown	
35.	"Yemen Underwear Bomb Plot" (Ibrahim Hassan Al-Asiri)	Unknown	
36.	Amine El-Khalifi	Unknown	

<u>Summary of Findings</u>: Based on our open source analysis of the last 36 terrorist plots attempted by al-Qaeda and its affiliates against the American homeland, since Obama was elected, 18 of those 36 appeared to have been influenced either inspirationally or operationally by now deceased alleged terrorist figure Anwar Al-Awlaki.

Interestingly, information on 16 out of the first 26 of these plots indicates some sort of influence, either inspirationally or operationally from Al-Awlaki. However after his September 30, 2011 death, evidence indicates only 2 out of the last 10 plots demonstrate some sort of inspirational or operational influence from Anwar Al-Awlaki.

As a cautionary note, these figures may not completely reflect the actual influence of Al-Awlaki given the open source, secondary nature of this inquiry.